



Final Evaluation for UNESCO projects

“Promoting an Enabling Environment for Freedom of Expression: Global Action with Special Focus on the Arab Region”, funded by the Government of Sweden – Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida)

“Promoting Freedom of Expression in Egypt, Libya, Morocco, Syria, Tunisia and Yemen”, funded by the Government of Finland – Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland

Evaluation report

27 July 2016

Contract number: 4500298118



The evaluation is implemented by

Particip GmbH

Table of Contents

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations.....	2
1 Executive summary.....	3
2 Projects' description.....	3
3 Evaluation purpose.....	4
4 Evaluation methodology.....	5
5 Findings.....	7
5.1. Relevance.....	7
5.2. Efficiency.....	11
5.3. Effectiveness.....	13
5.4. Impact.....	21
5.5. Sustainability-Management-Governance.....	25
6 Lessons learnt.....	29
7 Recommendations.....	30
8 Annexes.....	33
Annex 1 – Country reports.....	33
Annex 2 – List of interviewees.....	62

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

CSO	Civil Society Organisations
DAC	Development Assistance Committee
ENI	European Neighbourhood Instrument
ER	Expected Result
GEAP	Gender Equality Action Plan
HAICA	Tunisian Independent High Authority for Audiovisual Communication
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IO	Immediate Objective
MIL	Media and Information Literacy
OG	Overall Goal
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
Sida	Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency
ToR	Terms of Reference
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

1. Executive summary

The two extrabudgetary projects implemented by UNESCO with the funding of Finland and Sweden aimed at strengthening freedom of expression and press freedom in eight Arab countries and South Sudan. Several target groups were set in each project, most of them in close agreement. UNESCO carried out a very good identification of the needs of these target groups and designed activities that correctly addressed their problems. The project is consistent with UNESCO's strategic plans C/5 and C/4 and contributes to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) 5 and 16, to the objectives of the European Commission's (EC) European Neighbourhood Instrument (ENI) and to UNESCO's Priority Gender Equality Action Plan (GEAP).

The funds from donors were available on time in all the countries. The available resources were used efficiently. Most outputs were delivered on time, but the implementation of some activities was delayed or took more time than initially planned, due to external factors (war, insecurity, political tensions, etc.). The coordination mechanisms and contractual arrangements between UNESCO and its partners were conducive to achieving the expected results.

Numerous synergies were generated between the targeted countries, between the two evaluated projects and with other local and international partners. The five Expected Results (ER) for the Sida project were achieved. Four of the thirteen ERs for the Finland project could not be achieved due to the aforementioned external factors. The projects contributed to the five functions of UNESCO. UNESCO is perceived as a credible and neutral actor in all the beneficiary countries. Effective monitoring mechanisms were in place to track project success.

The long term effects achieved by the projects contributed to promoting an enabling environment for freedom of expression, ensuring the safety of media professionals, fostering Media and Information Literacy (MIL) and enhancing gender representation and youth participation in media. The projects did not create any unintended or negative long term effects.

Most of the long term benefits of the projects are sustainable. The project activities are supported by local institutions in the beneficiary countries. Many target groups do not have the financial capacity to maintain the benefits from the projects but agreements with local or international partners contributed to an increased likelihood for sustainability of the project benefits.

2. Projects' description

UNESCO, the United Nations agency with a specific mandate to promote “the free flow of ideas by word and image”, is committed to working to foster free, independent and pluralistic media. Its work is focused on implementing a variety of projects promoting freedom of expression and freedom of the press as a basic human right. These projects are funded either from the regular budget or from other donors (extra budgetary). This **external evaluation targets two extra budgetary projects** in the Arab region and South Sudan, “*Promoting an Enabling Environment for Freedom of Expression: Global Action with Special Focus on the Arab Region*”, funded by the Government of Sweden – Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida) and “*Promoting Freedom of Expression in Egypt, Libya, Morocco, Syria, Tunisia and Yemen*”, funded by the Government of Finland – Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland.

Finland project

The **Overall Goal (OG)** of the project funded by Finland is “*to support freedom of expression and the role of free, independent and pluralistic media in advancing democratic transition and development, citizen participation, respect for human rights and long-standing peace in Arab States*”.

The **Immediate Objectives (IO)** are: 1) Strengthening the legal and regulatory frameworks conducive to freedom of expression, press freedom and freedom of information (including media laws, freedom of information legislation, and regulatory frameworks linked to editorially independent Public Sector Broadcasters), fostering reforms in accordance to international

standards; 2) Ensuring the safety of media professionals, citizen journalists and bloggers; and combating impunity in the crimes committed against them; 3) Building professional and institutional journalism capacities, including for the safe use of ICTs by journalists and bloggers; 4) Advancing gender equality through enhanced freedom of expression and access to information (via specific actions, as well as by mainstreaming a gender-sensitive approach across all activities under the project); 5) Establishing two Youth Information Centres (in Lebanon and Jordan) contributing to the human security of Syrian refugee youth through enhanced information flows (including humanitarian information), provision of non-formal education, social and economic services.

Sida project

The **OG** of the Sida project is “*to strengthen freedom of expression, press and freedom of information in Arab countries and in South Sudan, in order to reinforce democratic participation and human rights, facilitate smooth political transitions, and contribute to sustainable development and long-standing peace*”.

The **IOs** are: 1) Promoting an enabling environment for; freedom of expression, press freedom and freedom of information: monitoring awareness-raising, building consensus and capacities and ensuring journalists' safety and combating impunity; 2) Ensuring journalists' safety and combating impunity; 3) Promoting freedom of expression on the Internet; 4) Fostering media and information literacy; 5) Focusing on gender and youth; 6) Support human resource in the Section for freedom of Expression at UNESCO.

Given the high degree of similarity between the OG in Sida's and Finland's interventions, in this report we will consider the OG as being the same for both projects.

3. Evaluation purpose

As part of the projects' monitoring, reporting and evaluation, and as agreed with the donors, UNESCO is required to present Finland and Sweden with a **joint external final evaluation** undertaken by an entity or individual external to UNESCO and the donor. This evaluation must examine progress made towards achieving the expected results, lessons learned and present recommendations regarding the programme's design and delivery, as well as on potential follow-up actions.

As outlined in the Terms of Reference (ToR), the main purpose of the final evaluation is to *assess the performance (activities, outputs, outcomes) of the two projects. The evaluation should also assess the quality of the main outputs and outcomes taking into account the relevant trends in the UNESCO Report World Trends in Freedom of Expression and Media Development especially in the Arab region. It should review the project's performance in respect to the agreed objectives of the project document focusing on the expected results and development objectives and also in terms of sustainability and gender equality.*

According to the ToR, the findings of the evaluation will be used by UNESCO and the donors to assess the achievement of the project results and furthermore to:

- *enhance the project's relevance, efficiency and effectiveness as well as shape the features of the project towards improvements for the second phase (for Sweden) and any follow up projects (with Finland);*
- *demonstrate the project's achievements and challenges as well as identify lessons learned and areas still to be covered;*
- *define the project's involvement to secure sustainability after activities end;*
- *define the possible roles of UNESCO and both donors (Finland and Sweden) after the initial funding phase.*

4. Evaluation methodology

Overall approach

The evaluation was conducted by an **Evaluation Team composed of three experts** (one team leader and two senior evaluators), supported by a Brussels-based backstopping team (a project manager, a senior project manager and a project director).

The methodology used in this evaluation followed the **OECD DAC guidelines**. The 5 DAC standard evaluation criteria for international development evaluations were used in our analysis: relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. In parallel, the analysis gave an answer to the **25 evaluation questions** that were defined in the Inception report, on the basis of the suggested questions contained in the ToR of the evaluation. The Evaluation Team focused primarily on **qualitative techniques for data analysis** for in-depth illustration of the project's achievements and challenges, as well as for comparison of information.

Limitations

There are a few limitations to the reliability and validity of the evaluation results, which derive from the difficulties found by the Evaluation Team throughout the evaluation process. The main **limitations** of the evaluation include the following:

- Only a small portion of the final beneficiaries of the projects could be interviewed by the Evaluation team, due to the short time that was allocated to the field phase in each country (2-3 days);
- Interpretation of the results is mostly subjective and may differ for each evaluator, although the Evaluation Team worked together to come to a consensus on findings and the rating of evaluation criteria;
- Evaluating two similar projects as part of a single evaluation was a challenge for the Evaluation Team. Most of the IOs, stakeholders, targeted countries and areas of work are the same in the two projects that were evaluated, but some differences exist between them. The structure of the logframe is also different in both projects. These slight differences complicated the conduct of the analysis and the presentation of findings in the sections "5.1. Relevance" and "5.3. Effectiveness" of this report;
- UNESCO provided to the Evaluation Team the "Indicator reporting" for 2014 and 2015, which contains an exhaustive assessment of the performance of Sida indicators, but no indicator report covering the whole implementation period was shared. This lack of information made more difficult the analysis on the achievement of the ERs done in the section "5.3. Effectiveness" of this report.

Data collection tools

The following data collection tools were used by the Evaluation Team during the evaluation process:

- Individual semi-structured interviews (physical presence)
- Individual semi-structured interviews (via Skype and telephone)
- Focus group interviews
- Direct observation
- Desk study of pertinent documents

A total of **nine countries were covered by the final evaluation**. The Evaluation Team visited five countries (Morocco, Tunisia, Jordan, Lebanon and South Sudan) and four countries (Egypt, Yemen, Libya and Syria) were covered via Skype interviews or by interviewing stakeholders based in the countries visited.

Key stakeholders

UNESCO regional offices provided the Evaluation Team with a **list of key stakeholders** that could be interviewed to collect data for the evaluation. This list served as the basis for setting the needed interviews that were conducted in the field or via Skype for the four countries that were not visited. An additional list of partners directly contracted via UNESCO Headquarters was also presented to the Evaluation Team by the client; some of these stakeholders were also interviewed. Further interviews were carried out during the World Press Freedom Day (WPF) event in Helsinki on 2-3 May.

Analysis methods

The data gathered through the evaluation was **triangulated to answer the 25 evaluation questions**. Qualitative data analysis techniques were used to synthesize and interpret qualitative data gathered through the evaluation process. The Evaluation Team used thematic analysis to interpret the findings. The three members of the Evaluation Team contributed to the qualitative data analysis.

A **brief analysis of the relevant trends** in the countries involved was also conducted. It took into account issues such as freedom of expression (online and offline), safety of journalists, access to information, MIL, with a focus on gender and youth. The results of this trend analysis were included in the section "1. Context" of the nine country reports that were produced as part of this evaluation (Annex 1).

Rating of evaluation criteria

Based on the analysis conducted during the evaluation process, **the Evaluation Team granted each criterion a score** from the following five options: high, medium-high, medium, medium-low and low. Using scores allows a wide margin of personal appreciation to the Evaluation Team. To ensure the highest possible reliability, the following criteria were applied for assessment:

Score	Description
HIGH	It means that the situation is more than satisfactory. All questions that relate to this criterion have positive responses and/or there is an exceptionally positive aspect that compensates other minor problems (e.g. good practices).
MEDIUM - HIGH	It means that the situation is satisfactory. Most questions concerning the criterion have positive answers. Despite comments or any improvements made, the quality of the activities does not question the good overall performance of the project.
MEDIUM	It means that there are minor issues to be corrected which could affect the overall operation of the project. Improvements proposed do not involve a major revision of the project's strategy but they should be taken into account as a priority.
MEDIUM - LOW	It means that there are major problems to be corrected. Improvements are needed; otherwise the overall implementation of the project will be affected.

	Most of the questions concerning the criterion have negative responses. The proposed improvements involve a limited review of the project strategy.
LOW	It means that there are weaknesses and problems so severe that, if they are not addressed, the project is likely to fail. To a great extent, all the questions concerning the criterion, have negative responses. Important adjustments are needed as well as a full review of the project strategy; otherwise the project is in risk of not achieving its objectives.

Gender approach

The promotion of gender equality between women and men is a strategic priority in all development actions carried out by UNESCO, Sida and the Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland. **A gender approach was adopted by the Evaluation Team in all phases of the evaluation process.** The evaluation results clearly reflect the impact of the two projects on gender equality in the targeted countries. Gender was also taken into consideration during the stakeholder sampling process. This crosscutting gender approach included analysing the gender aspects in project publications, online communication, communication materials, etc. **UNESCO Priority GEAP (2014-2021)** was used as a reference for the analysis.

5. Findings

5.1. Relevance > HIGH

❖ Question 1: Are the project objectives addressing identified needs of the target group(s)?

Different categories of beneficiaries/target groups were defined in each project. In the **Sida project, four target groups** were defined:

1. *Journalists and media professionals, independent media outlets/associations, journalism/communication educational institutions, and media freedom defenders, working at the international, regional and national levels;*
2. *Relevant stakeholders/actors involved in media legislation reforms around the world, and particularly in the focus countries, ranging from freedom of expression defenders and other NGOs, and including legislators, policy-makers, media professional organizations, lawyers and jurists associations, lawyers, communication/media researchers;*
3. *UNESCO, as the only UN specialized agency with the mandate to promote freedom of expression, by reinforcing the Organization's capacity to fulfil such mission;*
4. *The public at large, in the focus countries and around the world (given UNESCO's work at the global level and the multiplier effect of the actions proposed), particularly women and youth.*

Seven target group categories were defined in the **Finland project**:

1. *Media professionals, media managers, citizen journalists and bloggers;*
2. *Civil society organizations specializing on press freedom, freedom of information and media development, journalists' professional associations, women organizations;*
3. *National policy makers, ministries, parliamentarians, advisors and civil servants working on media issues, media focal points and experts in political parties;*

4. *Members of the National Constituent Assembly (NCA) in Tunisia (especially the commissions in charge of drafting legislation on freedom of expression and freedom of information), experts working with the NCA commissions on these matters, members of the future media regulatory body Members of the security forces (Tunisia and Egypt);*
5. *Women;*
6. *Syrian refugee youth in Jordan and Lebanon;*
7. *The population at large in the target countries, through strengthened freedom of expression, press freedom and freedom of information.*

As we can see above, most of the target groups were similar in both projects, but some differences exist. Displaced Syrian youth and the Tunisian members of the NCA were only considered target groups in the Finland project and UNESCO was only specifically targeted in the Sida project.

The OG of both projects addresses essential needs of all the target groups: freedom of expression, press freedom, democratic transition and development, Human Rights, peace and citizen participation. These are all fundamental needs for the population in the nine targeted countries.

In the Sida project, the six IOs address important needs of the four target groups. Promoting an enabling environment for freedom of expression (IO1), ensuring journalists' safety (IO2), promoting freedom of expression in the Internet (IO3) and fostering MIL (IO4) are essential needs for target groups 1), 2) and 4). The focus on gender and youth (IO5) addresses the needs of group 4), and the support to the Section for freedom of expression at UNESCO (IO6) gives an answer to UNESCO's (target group 3) need to strengthen its capacities in the freedom of expression domain.

In the Finland project, the five IOs address important needs of the seven target groups. Strengthening the legal framework conducive to freedom of expression (IO1) addresses needs of groups 1), 2), 5), 6) and 7), and to a lesser extent, 3) and 4). Ensuring the safety of media professionals (IO2) addresses a critical need of group 1) and 2). Building professional and institutional journalism capacities (IO3) addresses needs of the 7 groups. Advancing gender equality (IO4) and establishing two Youth Information Centres (IO5) give an answer to the needs of groups 5), 6) and 7).

❖ Question 2: Do the activities address the problems identified?

The implemented activities correctly addressed the problems and needs that had initially been identified by UNESCO and its partners, as well as the new ones that emerged throughout the implementation period. The main reasons explaining the high relevance of the implemented activities are the following:

- UNESCO's extensive expertise (both in the HQ and in the field) in the freedom of expression field allowed for a good needs-responsive design of the activities;
- In most of the targeted countries, specific needs assessments were conducted prior or during the implementation period. In Egypt and Libya, assessments based on UNESCO's Media Development Indicators (MDI) methodology were conducted. While the MDI study conducted in Tunisia in 2012 was not funded by the Finland/Sida projects (it was funded by Belgium), the follow up actions implemented according to its recommendations were funded by the two projects. These studies and assessments allowed for a good targeting of the needs of the target groups;
- A flexible approach was applied: UNESCO and its partners successfully adapted the implemented activities to their specific regional, national and local contexts, as well as to the evolving needs of the target groups. When planned activities lost their relevance due to external factors (war, security conditions, political tensions, etc.), UNESCO managed to find alternative activities that were more suitable for the new context;
- Local partners, CSOs and other key stakeholders influenced the design and implementation of activities through different formal and informal coordination mechanisms, thus enriching the relevance of the actions with their inputs.

❖ Question 3: Is the project consistent with the C/5 and C/4, the Millennium Development Goals (MDG) and other international development goals?

The evaluated projects are **consistent with UNESCO's Medium-Term Strategy for 2014-2021 (C/4)**, at different levels:

- The overarching objectives of C/4 -peace and equitable and sustainable development- are reflected in the OG of both projects;
- The global priorities of C/4 -gender equality and Africa- are addressed in both projects. Gender equality is IO5 in the Sida project and IO4 in the Finland project. Among the 9 countries targeted by the projects, 5 of them are African.
- C/4's Strategic Objective 9 "Promoting freedom of expression, media development and access to information and knowledge" is fully in line with the OG of both projects;
- Many of the projects' activities also indirectly contributed to C/4's Strategic Objective 6 "Supporting inclusive social development, fostering intercultural dialogue for the rapprochement of cultures and promoting ethical principles", for example the Youth Information Centres targeting Syrian refugees in Jordan and Lebanon, or the community radio listener clubs established in South Sudan.

The projects are also **consistent with UNESCO's Approved Programme and Budget for 2014-2017 (C/5)** because they contribute with extrabudgetary resources to the Main Line of Action (MLA) 1 for the Communication and Information programme "Promoting an enabling environment for freedom of expression, press freedom and journalistic safety, facilitating pluralism and participation in media, and supporting sustainable and independent media institutions" and to the MLA 2 "Strengthening free, independent; and pluralistic media, civil participation and gender-responsiveness communication for sustainable development".

None of the **eight Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)**, established by the United Nations for the period 2000-2015, directly addressed freedom of expression, which is at the core of the evaluated projects. However, the **projects are in line with MDG 3** "to promote gender equality and empower women" because IO5 in the Sida project and IO4 in the Finland project aimed at enhancing gender equality in the targeted countries.

The new 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development built on the lessons learnt from the MDGs and established 17 **Sustainable Development Goals (SDG)**. It covered only the last year of the projects' implementation period, as it was adopted in September 2015 by the UN. UNESCO's projects' work in media development and freedom of expression **contributes to SDG 16** "Peace, justice and strong institutions", and in particular to the target 16.10 "Ensure public access to information and protect fundamental freedoms, in accordance with national legislation and international agreements". The emphasis of both projects in gender equality **contributes as well to SDG 5 "Gender equality"**.

❖ Question 4: To what extent did the interventions under the project contribute to the objectives of the European Commission's (EC) European Neighbourhood Instrument (ENI)?

The ENI is one of the main tools used by the EU to develop the partnership relations with its 16 neighbours in the South and the East. It is worth over €15 billion and provides the bulk of funding to the European Neighbourhood Policy (ENP). The ENP supports political and economic reforms in these countries as a means of promoting peace, stability and economic prosperity in the region. **Seven of the nine benefited countries are considered "partner countries" under the ENP** (all except Yemen and South Sudan).

The evaluated projects contributed to one of the six Specific objectives of the ENI: "*promoting human rights and fundamental freedoms, the rule of law, principles of equality and the fight against discrimination in all its forms, establishing deep and sustainable democracy, promoting good governance, fighting corruption, strengthening institutional capacity at all levels and developing a thriving civil society including social partners*".

To support the achievement of the Specific objectives, the ENI addresses several priorities. Among the 11 priorities established at multi-country level, two are clearly in line with the evaluated projects:

- human rights, good governance and the rule of law;
- institutional cooperation and capacity development;

The ENI regulation does not offer a breakdown of these priorities, but the previous funding of similar projects under ENPI (the predecessor of ENI) shows that the evaluated projects clearly contribute to the objectives of the EC's ENI:

- “*Support to Civil Society and Media in Jordan*” (2013-2017, €10 million)
- “*Media and Culture programme / Nouvelles libertés d'expressions, citoyennes et numériques en Méditerranée*” (2014-2016, €1,5 million)
- “*Media and Culture programme/ Aswatona Fund for Media development*” (2014-2016, €1,2 million)

❖ Question 5: Did the project take into account and contribute to UNESCO's Priority Gender Equality?

Gender equality is one of two global priorities of UNESCO (the other one is Africa). The UNESCO Priority GEAP provides an operational framework for the implementation of Priority Gender Equality. It explains what gender equality means for UNESCO and provides guidance on how the organization will ensure that a gender equality perspective is reflected in all its policies, programmes and processes. During the first two years of project implementation (2012 and 2013), UNESCO's actions were guided by the GEAP for 2008-2013 and during the rest of the period, by the GEAP for 2014-2021.

According to C/4, “*The ultimate goal of UNESCO's Priority Gender equality is to strengthen the Organization's ability [...] to support the creation of an enabling environment for women and men from all walks of life, to contribute to and enjoy the benefits of sustainable development and peace. UNESCO also commits itself to ensure that the Organization's contributions to sustainable development and peace have a positive and lasting impact on the achievement of women's empowerment and gender equality around the globe.*”

The evaluated projects are under the responsibility of UNESCO's Communication and Information sector. The GEAP considers two ERs for this sector: ER1 “*Gender-sensitive journalism and gender-sensitive media policies and indicators developed and implemented*” and ER2 “*Gender equality approaches integrated into strategies and practices for building capacities of women and girls in ICT and into ICT and Knowledge Societies Fora; and gender inclusive access to information and knowledge reinforcement*”.

The design of the projects took clearly into account the GEAP:

- IO5 in the Sida project and IO4 in the Finland project aim to advance gender equality in the targeted countries;
- At the level of ERs,
 - ER5 in the Sida project directly addresses gender equality: “Enhanced focus on gender and youth in media throughout the project”; its indicator aims to “increase gender-sensitivity in media coverage”, which is directly linked to GEAP's ER1:
 - ER11 in the Finland project aims to reinforce the role of Public Service Broadcasters (PSB) in Morocco and Egypt as platforms for women's freedom of expression and as promoters of a culture of gender equality; its six performance indicators are also in line with GEAP's ER1 (number of media professionals trained on gender-sensitive approaches, number of women occupying editor in chief positions, etc.).
- Women are a specific target group in both projects.

The projects also contributed to the GEAP through numerous implemented activities: trainings for community radio stations to foster the equal representation of women in their programmes, production of radio programmes dealing with women's rights and the prevention of violence against women, an online course and open curriculum for independent media covering gender-sensitive mainstreaming, increased access for girls to information and communication through youth information centres, etc. The reports “World Trends in Freedom of Expression and Media Development” published in 2014 and 2015 incorporated a deep gender-sensitive approach; however, this approach is less visible in the MDI studies that were produced in Egypt and Libya. The project tried to enhance the participation of women by ensuring maximum gender balance during activities and gender-awareness was integrated in the activities to promote a culture of peace and dialogue; this was done even in those countries where no specific gender component was planned. In some countries, partnerships were established to maximise the impact of gender-related activities, with organisations such as UN Women and the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR). It was difficult to collect information on the gender-sensitive indicators (ER11 Finland) in some countries, i.e. Egypt. The detail of all the gender-related outputs that were produced in the framework of the projects is provided in the section “5.3. Effectiveness”, question 10.

Taking into consideration the findings explicated above, and using the evaluation matrix indicators as a guide, we can conclude that the UNESCO projects have a **HIGH RELEVANCE**.

5.2. Efficiency > HIGH

❖ Question 6: What measures have been taken during planning and implementation to ensure that resources are efficiently used?

The available resources were used efficiently. UNESCO worked closely with its partners and applied regular internal procedures and guidelines during planning and implementation to ensure this efficiency. The decentralised management of the projects' budget by the regional offices (except in the case of Syria, which was centrally managed from the HQ) ensured a good cost-efficiency of the resources. UNESCO field offices strived to implement activities and optimize their impact in the most efficient way, even with a limited budget.

The fact that the remuneration of UNESCO staff involved in the project was not covered by the project's budget significantly contributed to the cost-efficiency of the resources.

Two examples of measures taken to maximise the efficiency in the use of funds: i) in March 2016, instead of organising a training for journalists in Rabat (Morocco), an itinerant training was conducted, thus targeting many more beneficiaries from ten cities with the same budget; ii) in Yemen, UNESCO staff opted to reduce international travel by combining several activities together in the same period and location and prioritising regional activities.

In some countries, the coordination mechanisms that were established between relevant media stakeholders had a positive effect in terms of efficiency, as they allowed for an optimisation in the use of project resources and the elimination of eventual duplication of activities. An example of this was the work carried out by the joint Syrian-international coordination committee, launched in 2015 and facilitated by the Global Forum for Media Development. In South Sudan, the establishment of the South Sudan Media Sector Working Group (SSMSWG) and the Media Donor Group (MDG) also contributed to an increased efficiency in the use of the resources.

❖ Question 7: Have the outputs been delivered in a timely manner?

The **funds from donors were available on time** in all the countries. The planning for activities was respected in general and **most outputs were delivered on time**. However, the

implementation of some activities was delayed or took more time than initially planned, due to external factors:

- The delay in the discussion/adoption of some bills in the Tunisian Parliament and in the National Constituent Assembly (NCA) before 2014 had a spill-over effect in the implementation of some project activities;
- Training sessions in outside Tunis were postponed after the increased security risk following the terrorist attacks in March and June 2015;
- In Jordan, the Youth Information Centre (YIC) was launched in Mafrq later than expected mainly because obtaining the necessary approvals in the Ministry of Education took several months;
- In South Sudan, the activities implemented outside the capital Juba were slightly delayed due to security fears;
- In Egypt, most of the implemented activities were delayed due to the political situation.

We consider that **project management done by UNESCO was efficient** in general, because only those outputs affected by external factors were delayed or postponed.

❖ **Question 8: Is the project cost-efficient, i.e. could the outcomes and expected results have been achieved at lower cost by adopting a different approach and/or using alternative delivery mechanisms?**

The approach and mechanisms used by UNESCO staff in the regional office allowed the production of the expected outputs with the best cost-efficiency, which was particularly high in Libya and South Sudan, countries in which many valuable outputs could be delivered with modest budgets.

In some countries, more outputs than initially planned were achieved thanks to the financial contribution of UNESCO's partners. Two examples of this: i) an important contribution (both financial & in-kind) that was done by World Vision in Lebanon allowed the expansion of the original YIC to three YICs in different areas; ii) UN Women and the OHCHR gave a partial financial support to a specific gender component that was planned and implemented with the community radio stations in Tunisia.

❖ **Question 9: Have UNESCO's organizational structure, managerial support and coordination mechanisms effectively supported their delivery?**

Coordination and communication between UNESCO Headquarters (HQ) and the regional offices was satisfactory. The coordination and communication with the regional offices in Doha (for Yemen) and Rabat (for Tunisia) was also good and they provided the necessary technical support on sensitive issues such as personal security. The managerial support provided to the regional offices was effective in strengthening synergies under the two projects' components. It is too early to conclude the new arrangements with the UNESCO regional office in Cairo which came into effect in March 2016.

Stakeholders noted that human resources at the regional offices were qualified but, in some of them (i.e. Tunisia and Libya) their number is insufficient in relation to their needs.

The **coordination mechanisms and contractual arrangements between UNESCO and its partners were conducive for achieving the expected results**. However, some difficulties were faced in some countries. For example, in Jordan UNESCO sees the organisation Tech Tribes as a partner, but had to sign a contract for services with the organisation because there was a time limitation to sign an Implementing Partnership Agreement (IPA). This contradiction between the contractual arrangements and the real requirements and expectations of UNESCO generated some misunderstandings between both organisations, which to some extent impacted on the management and reporting of this component.

The evacuation of the UNESCO Tripoli office to Tunis in 2014 understandably led to some complications in project management. On the positive side it allowed the conduct of joint activities with Tunisian journalists and media, which contributed to the efficiencies of the project.

Due to the current conflict situation in Syria, UNESCO HQ in collaboration with Beirut and Amman offices managed and followed-up most of the activities targeting Syrian beneficiaries. Few activities (radio programs and YICs) were implemented in the field, namely Jordan and Lebanon, with the refugees as the main target.

Taking into consideration the findings explicated above, and using the evaluation matrix indicators as a guide, we can conclude that the UNESCO projects had a **HIGH EFFICIENCY**.

5.3. Effectiveness > MEDIUM-HIGH

❖ Question 10: What has been the progress made towards achievement of the expected outputs and expected results?

In the framework of the evaluated projects, a wide range of activities were implemented in the nine targeted countries and in Europe. **Most of planned activities were implemented**, but some could not be carried out due to the security or political context.

In both projects, several key areas of work were defined and specific activities were implemented under each one of them. In its joint annual reports, UNESCO grouped all the activities into four core areas of implementation and a fifth one specific to the project funded by Sida. Using this same approach, **the main outputs produced** in each category were the following:

1. Promoting an enabling environment for freedom of expression, press freedom and freedom of information online and offline:

- Training sessions for Civil Society Organisations (CSO) activists, representatives of the ministries and journalists in Tunisia;
- A 7 minute video on the project was produced and presented in Helsinki in the occasion of the WPF 2016;
- The Madrid 1 and Madrid 2 conferences (July and October 2015) on Libya were held. Media stakeholders affirmed their commitment to promote freedom of expression, responsible journalism and the absolute rejection of all forms of hate speech and incitement to violence; hundreds of relevant stakeholders (authorities, media experts, journalists, donors, CSOs, etc.) actively participated in the local, regional and international events organised in the occasion of World Press Freedom Day, International Day to End Impunity on Crimes against Journalists, the Right to Know Day and other events aiming to raise awareness on free press, freedom of expression and Internet freedom;
- A training conducted in April 2016 in Amman, Jordan, supported the training of Libyan journalists on conflict-sensitive reporting and resulted in the establishment of a draft Code of Ethics for Libyan journalists;
- In December 2014 a training and workshop for journalists, academics and media experts on best practices for media regulatory frameworks and integrating international standards and good practices into media policies was organised in Amman;
- A 2-day meeting brought together 20 international and regional media support groups, along with around 55 representatives of Yemen's media to identify the priority areas and emerging needs of the media sector in Yemen and to discuss a common strategy to support them;

- In May 2016, the Action Plan on Supporting Yemeni Media on Promoting Peace and Dialogue was launched with a support website to serve as an information platform for partners to follow up on implementation of the plan;
- In Morocco, three laws related to press freedom were discussed and approved by the Government's Council: law n°89-13 related to the status of professional journalists, law n°90-13 related to the establishment of the National Press Council as a self/co-regulatory mechanism and law n°31-13 on press and publishing and access to information;
- A UNESCO-supported website reporting violations on press freedom in Morocco was set up and became operational. Training was provided to lawyers, journalists and CSO representatives in monitoring and reporting cases of violations of press members;
- Seminar in February 2016 to present the study on "Web Radios in Morocco" was successfully conducted. The aim was to bring the need for a legal recognition of web radios to the attention of high-level attendees;
- In Egypt, three workshops focusing on media law and the right to access to information were run in 2014 to support media independence and the strengthening of legal guarantees for journalists in the country. A seminar was organised in 2015 on Media Policies and Freedom of Expression;
- Assessments of the media landscape based on UNESCO's Media Development Indicators (MDIs) were produced in Egypt and Libya; while the MDI study produced in Tunisia was not funded by the Finland/Sida projects (it was funded by Belgium), the follow up actions according to the recommendations of the MDI were funded by the projects;
- In Egypt, a workshop aimed at strengthening the rights of community media workers resulted in a set of recommendations aiming to legalise the status of internet radios that was presented for consideration to the Constitution Amendment Committee;
- A first ever comprehensive Arabic-language online course and open curriculum for independent media covering several issues (freedom of expression, gender-sensitive mainstreaming, ethical standards of journalists, technical skills, investigative journalism) was produced;
- A weekly radio programme targeting displaced Syrian youth was produced by Radio Voice of Lebanon and was accompanied by journalistic and technical capacity building and activities for 12 youth, 5 of whom went on to become correspondents;
- A training on media electoral coverage was delivered by Information International for journalists in Lebanon;
- A regional training workshop on the UNESCO MDI methodology targeting senior media experts from the Arab region was organised by UNESCO HQ Paris;
- A regional workshop on Photojournalism and Conflict-Sensitive Reporting in the Age of New Media was organised in Jordan;
- Two radio programmes targeting Syrian refugees were produced by Yarmouk FM in Jordan and Radio Voice of Lebanon to empower youth, provide them with humanitarian information and give them a voice to express themselves;
- A capacity-building for the Ethical Charter for Syrian Media (ECSM) in fund-raising and conflict management was organised;
- A research on Syrian audiences was conducted, which included data collection on media use, media literacy and perceived media/information needs of Syrian audiences in and outside the country across the geopolitical divides;
- Several coordination meetings for Syrian and international media organisations, moderated by the GFMD, were organized in Europe;

- Four YIC benefiting young Syrian refugees and host communities were established (three in Lebanon and one in Jordan), offering computer lab and library services as well as common space for awareness, integration and capacity building to its users;
 - Three new media laws were adopted in South Sudan (Media Authority Act, Broadcasting Corporation Act and Right of Access to Information Act), and members of the three corresponding media bodies were appointed;
 - The South Sudan Media Sector Working Group (SSMSWG), a Media Donor Group, a Media Support Strategy (MSS) and a country plan of action on safety of journalists were established;
 - Journalism student press clubs were established in 5 South Sudanese universities that have communication programmes;
 - In February 2016 a workshop to prepare journalists to meet the needs of audiences in the midst of an emergency (Lifeline programming), was organised in Amman for 35 journalists and media experts representing various media organisations and outlets in Yemen;
 - Nine publications on Internet Freedom were produced, translated, printed and/or distributed: “Global Survey on Internet Privacy and Freedom of Expression”, “Freedom of connection, freedom of expression: the changing legal and regulatory ecology shaping the Internet”, “World Trends in Freedom of Expression and Media Development” 2014 and 2015, “Keystones to foster inclusive knowledge societies: access to information and knowledge, freedom of expression, privacy and ethics on a global internet”, “Countering Online Hate Speech” in 2015, “Building Digital Safety for Journalism: a survey of selected issues”, pamphlets on Internet-related research and “Exploring the Evolving Media Landscape: Towards updating strategies to face challenges and seize opportunities”.
- 2. Ensuring the safety of media professionals, citizen journalists and bloggers, including for the safe use of ICTs, and combating impunity in the crimes committed against them;**
- UNESCO developed a training manual on Freedom of Expression and Public Order, which is available in Arabic, English and French. This manual provides legal references and tools for delivering training programs to security forces with a view to improving relations between security forces and the media, and encouraging respect for the safety of journalists in the field;
 - A training for 260 officers of the security forces (National Guard and Police) was conducted in Tunis and the regions on matters of freedom of expression, journalists’ role in democracy and safety of journalists;
 - Several workshops were conducted in 2014 to facilitate dialogue between Libyan media professionals and the security forces represented by the Ministry of the Interior;
 - A series workshops were conducted in May and June 2016 inside Yemen to reinforce the safety of Yemeni journalists, including the use of ICT;
 - Digital safety guidelines were published in cooperation with local partner and shared with a network of Yemeni journalists;
 - A model course on the safety of journalists was created for universities in the Arab region and was launched at the celebration of World Press Freedom Day (WPFDD) 2016 in Helsinki;
 - A training of 25 journalism students on safety of journalists (international humanitarian laws, kidnapping and hostage situations, personal safety and first aid) was carried out in Lebanon;

- A year-long training, capacity building and networking programme on the use of innovative ICT solutions for a better protection of Syrian human rights activists and journalists was conducted;
- Capacity-building training and workshops for Syrian journalists on video production, security and conflict-sensitive reporting were conducted;
- Training modules on safety of journalists were established at the University of Juba and at AMDISS Media Development institute;
- A UN Plan of Action for the Safety of Journalists and the Issue of Impunity was established in South Sudan;
- Human and technical capacities of South Sudanese media personnel were built in various specialised areas such as in safety of journalists, conflict sensitive reporting, photojournalism, Human Rights reporting, and four media associations were strengthened;
- 10 Media Observatory Committees (MOCs) reporting on violations committed against journalists were established in 10 South Sudanese states, although only 7 are functional and some of them are not trusted by the local journalists because they fear that the committees are infiltrated by the security services;
- Capacity-building workshops on legal media in Jordan for judges, law students and lawyers were organised, and an online portal was created as a comprehensive source on media laws and regulations; both activities aimed at strengthening the legal defence of journalists;
- A virtual reality film called "In Their Press Vests", was created as an advocacy tool on the safety of journalists and presented at international events held in 2016 such as the WPF and the World Humanitarian Summit.

3. Fostering Media and Information Literacy and enhancing journalism education;

- The UNESCO office in Cairo produced the Arabic version of the MIL kit and organised a seminar on it in the Middle Eastern and Northern Africa (MENA) region in 2014 with the objective of raising awareness on MIL among policy makers, university professors and education planners to encourage them to integrate the curricula into secondary school education;
- The UNESCO office in Cairo organised the Regional Forum on MIL in Arab States in Cairo in 2015 with over 140 participants from 14 countries of Arab region;
- UNESCO incorporated MIL into a number of Jordanian schools with the aim of introducing it into the national curriculum.

4. Enhancing gender representation and youth participation in and through media by guaranteeing freedom of expression and access to information, with focus on gender equality.

- Radio reports produced during the training sessions were delivered to the 6 community radio stations related to gender in Tunisia;
- Gender sensitive reporting in Morocco: an infographic on gender sensitive reporting was produced and disseminated among 300 newsrooms across the Maghreb region, a cooperation agreement was reached between HACA and UN Women assisted by UNESCO, and a Regional Conference "Les femmes font l'info" was held in Casablanca in April 2015;
- In March 2016, a training on gender issues for community media was conducted in Morocco;
- A YIC was established in Mafraq, north of the country, where the highest number of Syrian refugees is located. The centre was created within a public school for girls;

- Capacity-building training and sessions aiming to enhance the role of women were conducted in the Youth Information Centres (YIC) in Lebanon and computer classes for women were organised along with information sessions about violence against women;
- In the framework of the project “My Story”, 15 video reports on issues related to women were produced and published;
- Two listeners clubs for women and two for youth (mostly composed by girls) were established in two South Sudanese locations;
- In Tunisia, a specific gender component was planned and implemented with the community radio stations in partnership with UN Women and the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), focusing on the equal representation of women in their programmes. Training was provided on the right to education and work, rural women’s rights, and the prevention of violence against women;
- The Arabic-language online course and open curriculum for independent media that was produced covered gender-sensitive mainstreaming among other topics;
- The publications produced by UNESCO in the framework of the projects incorporated a gender-sensitive approach, in line with UNESCO’s GEAP. The reports “World Trends in Freedom of Expression and Media Development” incorporated a deep gender-sensitive approach, but this approach is less visible in the MDI studies that were produced in Egypt and Libya.

5. World Trends Report (specific for Sida)

- UNESCO produced the reports “World Trends in Freedom of Expression and Media Development” in 2014 and “World Trends in Freedom of Expression and Media Development: Special Digital Focus” in 2015. The first report was presented to Member States at UNESCO and the UN Headquarters in New York, as well as at public events in all UNESCO regions. The global Report and its six regional overviews have been downloaded more than 25,500 times, with 4,500 physical copies distributed to Member States, academics and civil society partners around the world. The second report was launched with events at UNESCO, UN Headquarters and at the UK Parliament in London and additional events have taken place in other countries; 3,000 copies have been printed and distributed.

Significant challenges in project implementation were faced in some countries:

- In **Libya**, the main challenges were the dispersion of journalists across the region, the cancellation of international flights to the country and the extreme political sensitivities present amongst the beneficiaries;
- The biggest difficulties in **Yemen** were related to the outbreak of the war, the closure of international airports, the lack of mobility for journalists within Yemen and outside the country, and security threats for beneficiaries involved in the project;
- Not all planned activities were implemented in **Egypt** due to the political changes which could not be foreseen at the time of drafting the ToR of the two projects; the political situation changed twice and some actions such as introducing gender sensitive indicators and following up on reforms to the media law became difficult to implement.

Numerous **synergies were generated between benefited countries**, as a result of the regional approach of the projects, which was a key factor in their implementation:

- **Libya** project Office’s efforts to combat hate speech in the media at the national level was very successful and, given the similarity of the Yemeni context, it was decided to replicate the initiative and process in **Yemen**. Libya Office along with a selected number of Libyan journalists were therefore invited to join the consultation meeting organized to create a roadmap to support Yemeni media in order to promote their project, share best practices

with Yemeni counterparts and encourage Yemeni journalists to undertake the same process;

- The manual on Freedom of Expression and Public Order developed in **Tunisia** has been directly used in other countries such as **Libya** and **South Sudan**, and has inspired work in others;
- The Sa'a Suriya radio programme targeting Syrian refugees that was developed in **Jordan** was so successful that was later replicated in **Lebanon**;
- Several activities aimed at introducing MIL into the national academic curricula across the region were implemented;
- Youth Information Centres were created in Lebanon and Jordan for Syrian refugees;
- Regional/global conferences and seminars were held (the Regional Forum on MIL in Arab States, the World Summit on Information Society+10, etc.);
- Some publications covering the whole Arab region (though not only) were produced (the World Trends in Freedom of Expression and Media Development reports for 2014 and 2015, the publications in the UNESCO Series on Internet Freedom, etc.); others were state-based but were interrelated because used similar methodology (such as the MDI studies);
- Global/regional events were held in the targeted region (the World Press Freedom Day, International Day to End Impunity on Crimes against Journalists, etc.);
- Regional trainings were conducted (the Arabic-language online course and open curriculum for independent media, a regional training workshop on the UNESCO MDI methodology, etc.);

Other **synergies were generated between Sida and Finland's** projects:

- The capacity building and networking program gathering CSOs and tech start-ups from the MENA region, initially funded by Finland, will continue beyond July 2016 with funding from Sweden under the new project funding;
- The international coordination support to Syria, led by the GFMD, received funding from both Finland and Sweden;

The lack of detailed information on the performance indicators -already mentioned in the "Limitations" sub-section ("4. Evaluation methodology" section)- made more difficult the analysis on the achievement of the Expected Results. On the basis of the collected data and the available documentation, we can conclude that all these outputs led to the **achievement of ER1, ER2, ER3, ER4 and ER5 for the Sida project**. ER6 was also achieved as a result of the recruitment of a Senior Freedom of Expression Specialist in UNESCO's Section for Freedom of Expression in the HQ.

The aforementioned outputs led also to the **achievement of ER1, ER3, ER4, ER5, ER7, ER8, ER9, ER11 and ER13 for the Finland project**. The ER2 was not achieved because of the war situation in Libya. In Yemen, the first stage of ER6 was implemented but the MDI study couldn't be completed because of war; ER6 was neither achieved in Syria for the same reason. When the proposal was submitted to the donor, the situation in both countries was permitting, but this changed later with the outbreak of war (2011 in Syria and 2015 in Yemen). In Syria, UNESCO decided to conduct instead an audience research. ER10 and ER12 were not achieved in Egypt as they were not included in the workplan for UNESCO Cairo office due to political reasons.

🔗 **Question 11: What are the reasons for the achievement or non-achievement?**

The **main reasons for the achievement of the ERs** in both projects are the following:

1. The ability of UNESCO to find the relevant partners to carry out the planned activities. Another strength is that the profile of these partners was very diverse (CSOs, universities, media professionals, local municipalities, etc.);
2. The involvement, participation and collaboration of the local authorities in many activities, particularly in awareness-raising activities on freedom of expression and safety of journalists;

3. The commitment of relevant media stakeholders with the projects;
4. The perception of UNESCO as a neutral and credible actor by the stakeholders;
5. The close work of UNESCO with the beneficiaries, which contributed to an increased effectiveness and relevance of the implemented activities;
6. Good skills, knowledge and experience of UNESCO staff involved in the project management, both in the field and in the HQ;
7. Good communication and coordination between the HQ and the regional offices;
8. The good performance of the SISTER internal management platform;
9. The flexibility of UNESCO project staff to adapt the activities to a changing environment and to evolving and emerging needs of the target groups;
10. The regional approach of the projects which generated numerous synergies between the benefited countries. These synergies led to an increased effectiveness that contributed to the achievement of the ERs;
11. The valuable contribution done by other local and international partners that supported with their funds the amplification or continuity of many activities.

🔗 Question 12: To what extent have beneficiaries been satisfied with the results?

Only a small portion of the final beneficiaries of the projects could be interviewed by the Evaluation team, due to the short time that was allocated to the field phase in the visited countries (2-3 days). In those cases where final beneficiaries could not be directly contacted, their feedback was obtained through other relevant stakeholders.

The consulted Tunisian beneficiaries of the training sessions expressed their satisfaction with the content and utility of these sessions. The community radio stations were happy to take part in the gender component activities, which they see as very necessary for their regular activities.

In **Libya**, beneficiaries were satisfied by the quality of the trainings, the spirit on consensus and the mutual respect that was present during all training sessions despite immense political divergence of the participants.

The training provided by BBC Media Action was highly appreciated by the participants in **Yemen**.

Beneficiaries in **Morocco** were reported to be satisfied with the content of the training and the support provided to them by the project.

In **Egypt**, final beneficiaries could not be interviewed in the field, but according to consulted stakeholders, they are satisfied with the results of the activities that were implemented.

The YIC in Kafarzabad (**Lebanon**) was closed at the moment of the field visit due to the municipal elections that were held in Beq'a area, but according to the consulted stakeholders, the **Syrian** and Lebanese young beneficiaries were very satisfied with the activities offered by the centre and its impact on the local community.

In **Jordan**, consulted beneficiaries of the workshops and training on media legal support for journalists were satisfied with the quality of the training and with the new knowledge and skills they gained. **Syrian** student girls from the Mafrag school who were consulted were satisfied with the new YIC, but admitted that they mostly use the library and the computer lab during class time and not during their free time.

In South Sudan, no final beneficiaries (radio listeners, trainees, etc.) could be interviewed but the benefited CSOs that could be interviewed were satisfied with the results achieved by the project and considered them big steps towards the defence of freedom of expression in the country. However, they were frustrated with the South Sudanese Government's lack of political will to enforce the new media laws and with the interference of the security services because they made it more difficult to achieve the expected results. The photo journalists met at the WPF in Helsinki considered themselves lucky to have been selected for the training provided to them and were

grateful for the support provided to them by the project and the opportunity to display their photos at the WPF in Helsinki.

The close work of UNESCO with the beneficiaries in all the benefited countries significantly contributed to their satisfaction with the intervention.

In general, donors and local partners are satisfied by the amount of beneficiaries that were supported by the projects.

❖ **Question 13: To which of the five functions of UNESCO (laboratory of ideas, standard-setter, clearing house, capacity-builder in Member States, catalyst for international cooperation) has the project been contributing?**

According to C/4, **UNESCO's functions** at the global, regional and national levels are the following:

1. Serving as a laboratory of ideas and generating innovative proposals and policy advice in its fields of competence
2. Developing and reinforcing the global agenda in its fields of competence through policy analysis, monitoring and benchmarking
3. Setting norms and standards in its fields of competence and supporting and monitoring their implementation
4. Strengthening international and regional cooperation in its fields of competence, and fostering alliances, intellectual cooperation, knowledge-sharing and operational partnerships
5. Providing advice for policy development and implementation, and developing institutional and human capacities

The projects have contributed to the five functions of UNESCO, in different ways. One example of UNESCO's contribution to each function is provided below:

The projects **contributed to function 1** by the production of the film called "In Their Press Vests", a 7-minute virtual reality 360° video in Syria aiming to bring insights into the everyday risks that journalists face in conflict zones and advocate for their safety worldwide. This innovative technique had not been used in the past as an advocacy tool on the safety of journalists in Syria.

The projects **contributed to function 2** through the publication of the reports "World trends in freedom of expression and media development" in 2014 and "World trends in freedom of expression and media development: Special digital focus in 2015". These reports explore the impact of technological, economic and political change on press freedom, pluralism, independence, gender and the safety of journalists.

The projects **contributed to function 3** through a training of Libyan journalists in Amman on conflict-sensitive reporting, which resulted in the establishment of a draft Code of Ethics for Libyan journalists.

The projects **contributed to function 4** by organising the Regional Forum on MIL in Arab States in Cairo in 2015 with over 140 participants from 14 countries of Arab region. Participants included policy makers, curriculum experts, educators, and media and information experts. As a result, the Arab Chapter of Global Alliance on Partnerships on MIL was launched at the Regional Forum as well as a detailed action plan for the Arab States GAPMIL Chapter.

The projects **contributed to function 5** through the elaboration of a media assessment in Libya based on UNESCO's Media development Indicators (MDIs) followed by a media monitoring to assess the emerging needs and changing political environment. The MDI study contains a set of recommendations for i) Universities and Ministry of Higher Education; ii) Ministry of Information and Government of Libya; iii) media outlets and journalism professionals; and iv) the international community and civil society.

❖ Question 14: Does UNESCO have a comparative advantage in designing and implementing this project?

UNESCO is perceived as a **credible and neutral actor in all the targeted countries**. This perception is an important comparative advantage in designing and implementing the projects, which allows it to maintain an equally good relationship with regulators, institutions, CSOs and other media stakeholders. The UNESCO logo gives reassurance to the partners and added credibility whereas other donors or agencies can be viewed as having a “hidden” agenda.

This perception of non-partisanship is **particularly valuable in the countries which have been worst hit by political and sectarian violence**, such as Yemen, Syria, South Sudan and Libya. In these countries, UNESCO is perceived as having the same distance with the different media stakeholders. In Egypt, credibility of UNESCO to deliver the planned activities and bring about albeit limited results was important especially at a time when the government announced during this period that all international aid projects were put on hold. Thanks to this credibility, UNESCO office in Amman is in a strong position to facilitate multi-stakeholder debate and consultations with the government on more enabling framework for the media freedom.

UNESCO is considered a reliable convener. It provides high-level reinforcement to support CSOs active in the sector of freedom of expression and promote democratic progress. The beneficiaries expressed their preference to work with UNESCO rather than with other international organisations in this field. Stakeholders consulted considered UNESCO a flexible partner, not prescriptive, and think that it as a multi-lateral body provides reassurance to the journalists.

❖ Question 15: Does the project have effective monitoring mechanisms in place?

Effective monitoring mechanisms were in place to track project success and adhere to results indicators. The use of SISTER, a set of IT-based management tools, which follows and supports the Results-Based Management (RBM) approach, ensured a good monitoring of the implemented activities. Regional UNESCO offices provided monthly reporting to the projects’ coordinator at UNESCO headquarters in Paris. In some countries, UNESCO offices reported also to sub-regional offices (i.e. Tunis office reported to the regional UNESCO office in Rabat).

Consolidated progress reports were prepared by HQ for both projects. Sida project started its activities on 30 April 2012, while the Finland project started on 30 January 2013. For that reason, in 2013 only a progress report for Sida was produced. In 2014 and 2015 joint progress reports were produced, in agreement with both donors, covering the activities of both projects. In 2016, a final joint donor report covering the whole implementation period (30 April 2012-30 July 2016) will also be produced by UNESCO. Considering the complementarity and mutually reinforcing nature of both projects, producing joint progress reports has been an efficient and effective practice.

In the field, the monitoring of activities was done jointly by UNESCO and its local partners. All the partners of UNESCO submitted activity reports (both narrative and financial) to UNESCO regional offices. Some of the partners conducted regular surveys to monitor and assess the effectiveness of the activities that were implemented.

Taking into consideration the findings explicated above, and using the evaluation matrix indicators as a guide, we can conclude that the UNESCO projects had a **MEDIUM-HIGH EFFECTIVENESS**.

5.4. Impact > MEDIUM-HIGH

❖ Question 16: What are the intended and unintended, positive and negative, long term effects of the project?

The results of the projects contributed to the achievement of Immediate Objectives (IO) 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 for the Sida project and IOs 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 for the Finland project. As a consequence, they greatly contributed to the achievement of the Overall Objective of both projects.

The **main long term positive effects** achieved by the projects in the five core areas of implementation are the following:

1. Promoting an enabling environment for freedom of expression, press freedom and freedom of information online and offline:

- A legal framework that complies with international norms on freedom of expression, freedom of the press and access to information was established in Tunisia (new Constitution and the Law on the Right of Access to Information were approved) and the capacities of the Tunisian Independent High Authority for Audiovisual Communication (HAICA) were strengthened;
- The role of Tunisian media as a space for free, independent and pluralistic democratic debate was reinforced and media capacity to cover the election campaign in a professional manner was increased;
- The Madrid Declaration, approved in Libya in July 2015, publicly proclaimed the commitment of the media directors and media owners to work together to reform the Libyan media landscape with a view to adherence to professional norms and international standards. It has become a sectoral reference point respected by many Libyan stakeholders, even those who did not sign it;
- A monitoring activity on the Libyan media conducted by UNESCO Libya in 2016 showed a real (factual) decrease in the use of “hate speech” among the signatories of the Madrid Declaration;
- The professional knowledge of Yemeni media experts and journalists on media regulatory frameworks was increased, thus reinforcing their capacity of integrating international standards and good practices into media policies;
- The laws approved by the Government in Morocco demonstrate progress toward strengthening press freedom and access to information, but they have been criticised by watchdogs such as Transparency International and Article 19 as falling short of international standards and lacking sufficient consultation with civil society;
- UNESCO-supported website reporting violations on press freedom in Morocco is a useful tool but is not meant to prevent journalists from prosecution;
- Capacity building of Moroccan web radios and support in their advocacy work has helped beneficiaries get involved in democratic transition and has put in place a professional cadre of trained web radios;
- In Egypt, the project held several regional events that contributed to building a network of campaigners in media freedom that includes editors, journalists and civil society activists;
- In Egypt, a number of trained local media professionals went on to become members of committees on media law as well as a specialised advisory group on media-self-regulation (which was later disbanded);
- Tensions between Syrian refugees and hosting communities in Jordan and Lebanon were diffused in four communities as a result of the work done by the YICs;
- Access of Syrian refugees to relevant humanitarian information and to communication increased in Lebanon and Jordan. Capacities, knowledge and skills of Syrian youth, including women, were strengthened;
- Awareness on the importance of freedom of expression, press freedom (including Internet freedom) and access to information was raised worldwide and in the targeted

countries through the organisation of multiple events related to the WPF and the Right to Know Day;

- An online platform developed by the project is the sole comprehensive source for media laws and regulations in Jordan, thus becoming a key resource for journalists and legal experts;
- The self-regulation capacities of the Syrian media professionals were strengthened as a result of the support provided to the the Ethical Charter for Syrian Media (ECSM);
- In South Sudan, the long term effects of the project increased as a result of the improved coordination of actions and information exchange between key media stakeholders, including donors. In the context of the conflict situation affecting the country since 2013 and the ensuing constraints (logistic, financial, security, etc.) derived from it, improved coordination and exchange is a major positive development factor for the media sector ;
- Enabling environment for the media, including first steps toward the establishment of the necessary legal framework, improved in South Sudan, but the application of the new media laws is low and there is a significant interference of the security services in the media regulation bodies;
- Technical and journalistic capacities of the media sector were strengthened in South Sudan.

2. Ensuring the safety of media professionals, citizen journalists and bloggers, including for the safe use of ICTs, and combating impunity in the crimes committed against them:

- The tension between security forces and journalists was reduced in Tunisia;
- In Yemen, the basis for dialogue between the two warring parties was created. This is an ongoing process and journalists from different backgrounds and media outlets were able to find common ground on issues such as safety and professionalism;
- Relationship between journalists and the UN humanitarian agencies working together in Yemen was improved;
- In Yemen, alternative media platforms were developed and journalists learned to report information in a safer, innovative way;
- The level of awareness among Yemeni journalists and local NGOs about the importance of safety planning and safety measures was raised and shared across journalists' networks;
- Capacities of Lebanese journalists in safety issues and electoral coverage were strengthened. It is likely that journalism students' knowledge on safety for journalists will increase as a result of the recent introduction of the module in the university curricula, but it is a bit early to assess this;
- The number of lawyers and judges with legal media knowledge to defend journalists increased in Jordan, but trained lawyers are not yet organised;
- The awareness about the challenges, risks and dangers faced by Syrian journalists was raised at the international level;
- Capacities of Syrian journalists on video production, conflict sensitive reporting, security measures and safety risk management were strengthened;
- The use of ICT solutions by CSOs in Syria to protect Human Rights defenders and freedom of expression increased;
- Relations between the media sector and the South Sudanese authorities, including security forces, were improved;

- Collection of data on violations committed against journalists in South Sudan improved;
- A country plan of action on safety of journalists was established in South Sudan. In the context of widespread impunity of violations committed against journalists, having this country plan is a critical achievement as it includes building capacity and identifying and implementing mechanisms that can provide safety and protection to journalists and media workers;
- The awareness on the safety of journalists worldwide and in the targeted countries raised through the organisation of the International Day to End Impunity for Crimes against Journalists.

3. Fostering Media and Information Literacy and enhancing journalism education:

- The Arab Chapter of Global Alliance on Partnerships on MIL (GAPMIL) was launched at the Regional Forum on MIL held in Cairo, as well as a detailed action plan for the Arab States GAPMIL Chapter;
- Awareness was raised on MIL among policy makers and integrating the MIL curricula into the secondary school education is under serious consideration in the Arab speaking countries from the MENA region.

4. Enhancing gender representation and youth participation in and through media by guaranteeing freedom of expression and access to information, with focus on gender equality:

- Gender-sensitive reporting capacities were strengthened in Morocco among media, including community media (web radios);
- Collaboration, coordination and exchange between Syrian media and CSOs, particularly on issues concerning women has increased;
- Gender approach in the Syrian independent media has been strengthened and the coverage of issues related to women has increased;
- Radio coverage of relevant community issues, including women and gender issues, increased in South Sudan and in Tunisia;
- Access of Syrian refugee girls to relevant information and to communication increased in Lebanon and particularly in Jordan (as the YIC was established within a girls' school). IT skills of women were strengthened and the awareness on women rights was raised;
- The capacities of independent media staff were strengthened as a result of the Arabic-language online course and open curriculum which covered gender-sensitive mainstreaming.

5. World Trends Report (specific for Sida):

- Governments, media, academia, the private sector and civil society have more information on world trends in freedom of expression and media development, which can be used for decision-making. The WTR filled an important knowledge gap in information on press freedom and the safety of journalists and laid credible basis for strong policy advocacy and reform in this realm. Several international organisations (including UN agencies) used the findings of the WTR as part of their advocacy work.

The project **did not create any unintended or negative** long term effects.

❖ Question 17: To what extent can the changes that have occurred as a result of the project be identified and measured?

All these long term effects that were achieved can be identified, but most of them cannot be measured as they are qualitative (increased capacities of the media staff, increased awareness on

freedom of expression, strengthened gender approach in the independent media, etc.). However, some of them have a quantitative nature and therefore can be measured: the number of violations committed against South Sudanese journalists reported by the MOCs, the number of new media laws that were approved in Tunisia, the number of secondary schools in which the MIL curricula was integrated into the education, etc.

❖ Question 18: To what extent can the identified changes be attributed to the project?

The identified changes are a direct result of the projects, but the degree of attribution varies in each case. For example, the knowledge gained by Jordanian lawyers that were trained on media legislation and results achieved through monitoring and reporting national mechanism for media violations in South Sudan are fully attributable to the evaluated projects, while the contribution of UNESCO in the elaboration of the new Tunisian media laws is only partial, as other actors intervened in the process too.

Taking into consideration the findings explicated above, and using the evaluation matrix indicators as a guide, we can conclude that the UNESCO projects had a **MEDIUM-HIGH IMPACT**.

5.5. Sustainability–management–governance > MEDIUM-HIGH

❖ Question 19: What is the likelihood that the benefits from the project will be maintained for a reasonably long period of time after the project's finalization?

The sustainability of the benefits from the projects is closely linked to the evolution of freedom of expression, democracy, press freedom and peace in the targeted countries. For that reason, in this section we structured our analysis per targeted country instead of per core areas of implementation (which was the approach used in the “5.3. Effectiveness” and “5.4. Impact” sections).

In **Tunisia**, all the benefits from the projects are likely to be maintained after its finalisation: i) the new legal framework enjoys broad political and popular support; ii) HAICA, the media regulatory body, was strengthened and is now in a position to act and to regulate the media landscape; iii) the National Guard training centre has integrated UNESCO’s training manual “Freedom of expression and Public Order” into their officers' curriculum; iv) increased capacities of local radios are likely to be sustainable; v) the awareness that was raised on the right for freedom of expression in the country is very likely to be maintained and even increased.

In **Libya**, the benefits from the projects are likely to be maintained after their finalisation: i) the Madrid Declaration does not need additional funds to continue to exist, its principles were appropriated by the Libyan stakeholders and the Declaration is beginning to be appreciated by the citizens; a monitoring body for the Madrid Declaration is needed to maintain the benefits of the project; ii) the sustainability of the Madrid Declaration will probably translate into a continuation of the decrease in the use of “hate speech” among its signatories; iii) the new Code of Ethics for Libyan Journalists and Media Professionals is likely to be sustained because the concept of media self-regulation is becoming accepted within the sector and the Libyan actors understood the importance of standards.

In **Yemen**, the main benefits from the projects are likely to be sustained but some challenges remain: i) the dialogue established between the two warring parties is likely to be sustained as the main obstacle of having all parties around the same table was achieved and the process can continue even with limited financial support; ii) the improved relationship between journalists and humanitarian actors needs additional efforts to be maintained after project finalisation; iii) the improved awareness about the importance of safety is likely to be sustained through continuous partnerships with international and local organizations to train Yemeni journalists and through the sharing of knowledge among journalists' networks in Yemen; iv) the Action Plan on Supporting Yemeni Media in promoting Peace and Dialogue is likely to contribute to sustainability in

responding to the crisis and is leading to implementation of actions in a coordinated manner; v) the fact that, since May 2016, activities can now be implemented on the ground is a positive indicator of sustainability and will lead to a stronger impact on the Yemeni media sector.

In **Morocco**, the benefits from the projects are likely to be maintained after its finalisation, but additional actions are needed: i) the media laws approved by the Government are likely to be maintained, but long term effects of the action will require improvements to these laws and their effective implementation; ii) the civil society web portal e-Joussour.net is a means of contributing to sustainability of project benefits and contributing to reinforcing local ownership of the reform process; iii) training of trainers workshops that were conducted by UNESCO are an important factor of sustainability of the project benefits in the longer term; iv) much work still needs to be done to make gender sensitive reporting in Morocco mainstream but the newsletter and infographics provide useful indicators to monitor progress.

In **Egypt**, the benefits from the projects will face significant difficulties to be sustained: i) this sustainability depends on the evolution of the country towards embracing democracy and journalists and editors being able to work without fear of reprisal, as well as on a decision by the government to proceed with some of the achievements of the projects; ii) increased awareness on MIL among policy makers is likely to be sustained and may lead in the mid term to more secondary schools integrating the MIL curricula into their education; iii) although some of the achievements were driven by civil society initiatives (network of campaigners in media freedom, committees on media law and the specialised advisory group on media-self-regulation and network of stakeholders was set up who are interested in the development of necessary legislation for enabling community media), the risk of arrest reduces the ability of civil society to build on these achievements for the moment.

In **Lebanon**, most of the benefits of the projects are likely maintained after the project's finalisation: i) the modules on safety for journalists can be used in other Lebanese or Arab universities; ii) the journalistic skills that the Syrian youth gained as a result of their participation in the radio programme can be built upon; iii) although the local municipalities are covering the running costs of the YICs, they are also supported by the international partners (World Vision, Caritas and UNHCR); iv) the online course for independent media can be re-used at no additional cost; v) NGOs within the area where the YIC are present are building on their existence and using it for their own activities, hence, sustaining the YICs use and mission; vi) Radio Voice of Lebanon would like to continue producing radio programmes for the Syrian population, but these programmes are not sufficiently profitable for this private radio so more support would be needed; vii) additional conferences, meetings, training and events on freedom of expression and press freedom would require additional external funds.

In **Jordan**, sustainability of the benefits is appropriate: i) the new equipment of the YIC is likely to be used for several years but it would be difficult for the school to fund an eventual renovation of the computer lab and library without further support from donors; ii) the new capacities and skills gained by the trained teachers are likely to be sustained in the future, and will benefit several cohorts of new students every academic year; iii) the knowledge that lawyers and judges gained is likely to be maintained, but the media legislation has changed since the trainings were conducted, so this knowledge may lose value if it is not complemented with additional courses; iv) no network has been created yet by the trained lawyers, so the sustainability and updating of the website with legal media support is not guaranteed; to address this concern, the Amman Office has just formulated a new proposal for the new UNESCO-Swedish funding 2016-2017, which foresees the establishment of the network; v) the strong gender responsiveness of the project is likely to continue in the future, as new female students will enrol every academic year.

In **Syria**, most of the benefits of the projects are likely maintained after the project's finalisation: i) the new knowledge, capacities and skills that media experts acquired are likely to be maintained for a long period of time; ii) the Ethical Charter for Syrian Media is likely to be sustained in the long term as adopting an ethical, rigorous and professional approach is in the interest of a new independent media; iii) the film "In Their Press Vests" can be used in the long term as an advocacy tool on the safety of journalists, without extra cost; iv) the films that were produced on issues related to women can be used for a long time as an awareness raising tool, but it will be difficult for media and civil society actors to produce additional content without additional funds.

In **South Sudan**, most of the benefits of the project are likely to be maintained after its finalisation: i) the South Sudan Media Sector Working Group (SSMSWG), the Country Plan of Action on Safety of Journalists and the Media Support Strategy as they are needed by the media stakeholders; ii) all the knowledge gained in training, workshops and public events; iii) the media observatory committees (MOCs), as it is in the interest of journalists to maintain them, though a serious issue is the lack of trust of some journalists towards the MOCs which puts at risk their sustainability; iv) the three new media laws, although their degree of application is still low; the criminalisation of defamation and the interference of the security services are negative factors for sustainability; v) the training modules on Safety of Journalists and in media at the University of Juba as they do not imply any extra cost and are requested by the students; vi) the inclusion of media freedom and safety of Journalists as an agenda point in the South Sudan Police Accountability Mechanism, but will depend on the evolution of the political situation; vii) the establishment of the Media Donors Group, as it is in the interest of donors to improve coordination and to avoid eventual duplications; viii) if additional technical and material support (transportation, refreshment, training) is not provided to the radio listener clubs, their sustainability may be at risk.

🔗 Question 20: Is the project supported by local institutions and well integrated with local social and cultural conditions?

In **Tunisia**, the projects received support from the President of the Republic showing the political will to anchor freedom of expression and journalist safety in the Tunisian traditions.

In **Libya**, the projects received written acknowledgements from the Presidency Council of the Government of National Accord, the House of Representatives, key municipalities and respected personalities.

The projects in **Yemen** did not receive any additional financial support from the institutions, neither local nor at the government level.

The projects received in **Egypt** the support of important stakeholders from the beginning: for example, the Head of school of law and politics at American University became Minister of Foreign Affairs two weeks after UNESCO Cairo office met him and he pledged his support to the projects' objectives.

In **Morocco** the projects are recognised by representatives of the government, the High Authority of Audiovisual Communication (HACA) and CSOs active in the field of freedom of expression, such as FMAS, as being well integrated with local cultural conditions.

In **Lebanon**, the project is supported by local institutions: i) the municipalities of Kfarzabad, Qobayat and Khiam are covering running costs of the YIC; ii) the safety module was developed for incorporation into university journalism curricula, in coordination with universities; iii) the Minister of Information, Deans of Universities Media faculties and speakers from the Lebanese Parliament participated in conferences organised by the project.

In **Jordan**, the YIC is fully integrated with local social and cultural conditions as it was installed within a public school for girls and is supported by the municipality. The Ministry of Education supports the YIC as all activities that were carried out in the school had to be approved by them. The Ministry of Planning and International Cooperation had put in place very restrictive criteria to allow for the implementation of any project/activity targeting Syrian refugees, especially youth, which is a negative factor of sustainability of the project benefits. After the London "Supporting Syria and the Region" Conference of February 2016, some of the restrictions -those related to Vocational education and employment for Syrian refugees- have been lifted, as part of the "Jordan Compact" announced at the same Conference.

The level of cooperation or coordination between **Syrian** media based in Turkey and the Turkish authorities is low. However, this is unlikely to affect the sustainability of the benefits of the projects, as the journalists' capacities will still play a part in the development of Syrian media.

In **South Sudan**, the project is supported by media stakeholders, local authorities, training institutions, the police and media regulation bodies.

❖ Question 21: Are requirements of local ownership satisfied? Are relevant stakeholders in the countries involved committed to media self-regulation?

The commitment of the local target groups with the projects seems to be high in all the benefited countries. Consulted stakeholders share the objectives of the projects and see UNESCO as a legitimate and reliable partner in their efforts to achieve them. This strong local ownership also reflects that the needs that were addressed by the projects are relevant for these groups.

Journalists and other local relevant media stakeholders (media professionals, independent media outlets/associations, journalism/communication educational institutions, media freedom defenders, etc.) in the targeted countries are truly committed to media self-regulation. The important advances made in this field in Libya, South Sudan, Egypt and Syria are a good proof of this commitment.

❖ Question 22: Are relevant host-country institutions characterized by good governance?

The level of governance is low in all the targeted countries, but the institutional deficiencies differ in each case.

In **Lebanon**, the main reasons for this low governance are the structural weakness of the State and the deep political and sectarian divides that block the institutions. **Syria, Yemen and Libya** can be considered failed States due to the war that is ravaging them and the decomposition of the institutions, so the idea of “governance” is irrelevant at the current moment in these countries. In **Morocco and Jordan**, the monarchic regimes in place are stable, which is a requirement for good governance, but both countries rank low in all the available democracy indexes. The current **Egyptian** regime is considered authoritarian by most of the international community and there is no real separation of powers. The overall level of governance in **South Sudan** remains very low because war is still ongoing in many areas of the country despite the advance of the peace agreements signed in August 2015, and its institutions are young and provisional. **Tunisia** is probably the country with higher levels of governance among the targeted countries, as a result of a successful transition from dictatorship to democracy and rule of law, but many post-revolution institutions are still weak and/or transitional.

❖ Question 23: Do obstacles related to media legislation that constrains or interferes with media self-regulation, or challenges related to insufficient political will exist?

No significant conflicts between media legislation and self-regulation have been detected in the countries targeted by the projects. Self-regulation capacities are weak in most of these countries, but mostly due to low journalistic skills and a poor respect of ethical charters and standards, rather than to interferences with the media legislation. One case of conflict may be **Jordan**, where journalists are required to join the Jordanian Press Association (JPA), which is controlled by the state, and the law prohibits the creation of alternative press associations, thus somehow restricting the possibilities of self-regulation of the media sector.

In **South Sudan**, there seems to be insufficient political will from the authorities to fully apply the existing media legislation, without interferences from the security services. Consulted stakeholders complained that the Ministry of Justice did not make the media law public yet.

The laws approved by the Government in **Morocco** demonstrate progress toward strengthening press freedom and access to information, but they have been criticised by watchdogs such as Transparency International and Article 19 as falling short of international standards and lacking sufficient consultation with civil society.

In **Egypt**, no laws or acts are being adopted by parliament; the broadcast law was not introduced to parliament.

❖ Question 24: Do partners have the financial capacity to maintain the benefits from the project?

The **Tunisian** partners and beneficiaries have a limited financial capacity to maintain the benefits from the project, but international donor community gives a high priority to support freedom of

expression and the media in the country. The EU has several large technical assistance projects in the pipeline to reinforce the media sector in Tunisia (10 Million €). The situation is similar in **Morocco**.

In **Yemen**, the lack of financial resources of the target groups may impact negatively the sustainability of the benefits, especially for journalists and independent media outlets in the country. However, some activities received additional financial support from partners: efforts to improve the safety, including occupational and digital safety, of Yemeni journalists were supported by contribution of Rory Peck Trust and Al Jazeera Media Network in organizing hostile environment trainings for 25 Yemeni journalists.

In **Libya**, a monitoring body for the Madrid Declaration is needed to maintain the benefits of the project, but this could be implemented with minimal financial resources.

In **Egypt**, additional donor funding is not currently required according to interviews held with project stakeholders.

In **Lebanon**, the three YICs have very limited financial capacities, but they are financially supported by the international partners (World Vision, Caritas and UNHCR). The success of the radio programme led UNHCR to contribute to such efforts by disseminating 1000 radio units to Syrian families in need.

In **Jordan**, Mafrq school could cover its maintenance with its own resources, but it would be difficult for the school to fund an eventual renovation of the computer lab and library without further support from donors. Upon the ending of the period funded by Sweden for the airing of the Sa'a Suriya radio programme, UNFPA supported an extension of the programme, followed by a one-year funding through the government of Japan.

In **Syria**, most of the trainings could not be sustained without additional funds as CSOs do not have the necessary financial capacity to implement them; however, CSOs are now in a better position to deal with external partners and a step forward towards raising funds for their projects.

In **South Sudan**, most of the members of the radio listeners clubs ask for technical and material support (transportation, refreshment, training). If this is not provided by the community radios, the commitment of the members may be negatively affected and the sustainability of these clubs may be at risk. Minimal funds would be needed to sustain them.

❖ Question 25: Are there any other local factors that significantly challenge the medium and long-term maintenance of the project results?

The violent conflict affecting **Yemen, Syria, Libya and South Sudan** is a negative general factor of sustainability of the benefits from the projects in these countries.

Taking into consideration the findings explicated above, and using the evaluation matrix indicators as a guide, we can conclude that the UNESCO projects had a **MEDIUM-HIGH SUSTAINABILITY**.

6. Lessons learnt

The **main lessons learnt from the implementation and evaluation** of the projects are the following:

- The numerous synergies that were generated between the projects and other local and international partners permitted to UNESCO not only to increase the impact of many implemented activities, but also their sustainability;
- The regional approach of the projects generated numerous synergies between the countries benefited by the two projects. Some activities were carried out in common in different countries, regional initiatives were undertaken, successful activities were replicated in other countries, etc. Despite their specificities, all these activities shared

common objectives and there was regular communication and coordination between them. These synergies led to an increased effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the projects.

- The regional approach taken by UNESCO and the donors also implied that many small activities were implemented in a big number of countries. Therefore, the budget that was available for each country was relatively reduced. This dispersion of the funds limited the potential impact and sustainability that could have been achieved in each country;
- As highlighted in the draft joint donor report prepared by UNESCO, one of the major lessons learnt is that despite the apparent polarization amongst journalists, once all of them are invited to engage in an activity, there is a strong will from the media sector to unite and work together regardless of political affiliations. It is therefore possible for UNESCO to play an important role in peace building through the media by focusing on such types of activities and encouraging journalists to work on issues that unite all of them;
- The high level of coordination between the two evaluated projects in the planning, implementation and reporting of activities had a positive effect on the global efficiency, effectiveness and impact of the intervention. However, the separate management of two grants covering two very similar projects (Finland and Sida) negatively affected the efficiency and limited the generation of synergies;
- The projects did not cover the cost of project staff in the targeted countries, so the salaries of UNESCO staff who were in charge of the planning, management and follow up of the activities had to be assumed by UNESCO with other resources. This had a positive effect in terms of cost-efficiency, but sometimes the projects workload overloaded UNESCO staff;
- Events organised in the occasion of international UN days, such as the 3rd May World Press Freedom Day, 2nd November International Day to End Impunity on Crimes against Journalists and the 28th September Right to Know Day, proved to be excellent awareness raising tools not only among the general public but also among all sorts of media stakeholders, including public and security officers.
- The *World Trends Report* filled an important knowledge gap in information on press freedom and the safety of journalists, as it was the first to present a systematic trend analysis of the multiple aspects of media freedom, pluralism, independence, and safety, while giving special attention to gender-sensitive considerations. The WTR constituted a significant contribution by UNESCO to international understanding and also proved to be an important tool for advocacy.

7. Recommendations

On the basis of the aforementioned findings, the Evaluation Team gives the following general and country-specific recommendations to UNESCO, so that they can be taken into account in the second phase of the Sida funded project (called “Promoting democracy and freedom of expression”) and in other eventual future similar programmes:

General recommendations

1. The regional approach taken by UNESCO and the donors implied that many small activities were implemented in a big number of countries. Therefore, the budget that was available for each country was relatively reduced. This limited the potential impact and sustainability that could have been achieved in each country.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, if the available budget is also similar, reduce the number of benefited countries as to increase the impact and sustainability achieved at the country and sub-regional levels.

2. The separate management of two grants covering two very similar projects (Finland and Sida) negatively affected the efficiency and limited the generation of synergies.

RECOMMENDATION: In order to provide flexibility and more synergies among activities, countries/regions and funding, it is recommended to pool the resources in the future, based on a joint framework.

3. The regional activities implemented in the framework of the projects covered a wide range of countries with very different media, political and cultural contexts.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, increase the number of sub-regional activities (for example in the sub-regions of North Africa, Middle East, etc.). By offering activities better adapted to the sub-regional context specificities, the relevance, impact and sustainability of the activities could be increased.

4. The projects did not cover the cost of project staff in the targeted countries, so the salaries of UNESCO staff who were in charge of the planning, management and follow up of the activities had to be assumed by UNESCO with other resources.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, the donor should try to cover -at least partially- the salaries of the staff dedicated to the project in the targeted countries, as a way to increase the effectiveness and impact of the implemented activities.

5. The structure of the logframe is different in both projects. These differences complicated the conduct of the analysis and the presentation of the Relevance and Effectiveness of the projects.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, where at least two donors are keen to coordinate their projects, this coordination should start in the design/formulation phase and not after. This would allow for the elaboration of a single logframe for all the projects, something that would significantly ease the monitoring and evaluation of the implemented activities.

6. The ability of UNESCO to find the relevant partners to carry out the planned activities was one of the major factors of achievement. Another strength is that the profile of these partners was very diverse (CSOs, universities, media professionals, local municipalities, etc.).

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, should maintain the collaboration with relevant partners to maximise the effectiveness, impact and sustainability of the intervention.

Country-specific recommendations

1. The benefits brought by the capacities and skills that lawyers and judges gained in **Jordan** may lose value if they are not complemented with additional courses. Since the workshops and training were given, new media related laws have been approved and amendments made to audio visual laws.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, give continuity to training on media law, incorporating recent changes in media laws into the content of the training.

2. If additional technical and material support (transportation, refreshment, training) is not provided to the radio listener clubs that were created in **South Sudan**, their sustainability may be at risk. Minimal funds would be needed to sustain them.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, give continuity to the support provided to the women and youth listener clubs, in order to ensure their sustainability. If adequately supported, these clubs could become excellent tools for awareness raising at the community level.

3. In Jordan, the contradiction between the contractual arrangements with Tech Tribes and the real requirements and expectations of UNESCO generated some misunderstandings between both organisations, which to some extent impacted on the management and reporting of this component.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, make the necessary arrangements in advance, so that an Implementing Partnership Agreement (IPA) can be signed with the local partners, instead of a contract for services.

4. In South Sudan, ten Media Observatory Committees (MOCs) were established in ten states, although only seven are functional and some of them are not trusted by the local journalists because they fear that the committees are infiltrated by the security services.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, conduct an external assessment in order to find out how many MOCs are effectively functioning and how trust between them and journalists can be built.

5. In Jordan, the Youth Information Centre (YIC) was launched later than expected mainly because obtaining the necessary approvals in the Ministry of Education took several months.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, UNESCO should try to obtain all the necessary approvals before the implementation of the activities, to avoid possible delays or postponements.

6. In Tunisia, technical support and trainings related to gender were provided to only six community radio stations;

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, UNESCO should try to provide the technical support and trainings related to gender to a bigger number of community radio stations.

7. In Libya, the evacuation of the UNESCO Tripoli office to Tunis in 2014 understandably led to some complications in project management. Stakeholders noted that human resources at the UNESCO office were qualified but their number is insufficient in relation to their needs.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, UNESCO should try to strengthen the team of Libya office with more human resources.

8. In Yemen, the improved relationship between journalists and humanitarian actors needs additional efforts to be maintained after project finalisation.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, UNESCO should give continuity to the support provided to improve relationship between journalists and humanitarian actors through joint activities inside Yemen.

9. In Libya, the main actors understood the importance of standards and are now more committed to a media self-regulation body, but there is not enough expertise inside the country to establish this kind of institutions.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, UNESCO should make the necessary arrangements to benefit from the expertise gained by the HAICA, which could serve as an example to replicate with the needed adaptation to the Libyan context.

10. The benefits brought by the capacities and skills that **Libyan** journalists gained may lose value if they are not complemented with additional courses.

RECOMMENDATION: In future similar interventions, UNESCO should give continuity to training for journalists. If the security conditions permit it, UNESCO should study the possibility of conducting these trainings inside Libya, as this would maximise their impact and sustainability.

Annex 1 Country reports

The Evaluation Team produced, as agreed with UNESCO, a report for every targeted country on the basis of the collected data. In the country reports, each evaluation criterion was given a rating according to the methodology detailed in Section 4 “Evaluation methodology” of this report. In the table below, the detail of all the evaluation criteria ratings is provided, both at the country and the global levels:

	Relevance	Efficiency	Effectiveness	Impact	Sustainability
Tunisia	HIGH	HIGH	HIGH	HIGH	HIGH
Libya	HIGH	HIGH	HIGH	HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH
Yemen	HIGH	HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM
Morocco	HIGH	HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH
Egypt	HIGH	MEDIUM	MEDIUM-LOW	MEDIUM-LOW	LOW
Lebanon	HIGH	HIGH	HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH
Jordan	HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH
Syria	HIGH	HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH
South Sudan	HIGH	HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH
GLOBAL	HIGH	HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH	MEDIUM-HIGH

1. Context of Tunisia

Freedom of expression is considered a major area of progress in the democratic transition in Tunisia following the 2011 revolution. Significant progress has been achieved in terms of legislation and practices in all related areas: freedom of expression, freedom of press, right to information, freedom to express an opinion, and publication.

The new Tunisian Constitution was adopted in January 2014, following three years of drafting and debate. Among the fundamental rights and freedoms guaranteed by the new Constitution are the rights of expression, of opinion and of information. These achievements are the result of national and international efforts, including UNESCO action, in creating awareness and strengthening competencies of decision makers in the field of freedom of expression.

Tunisia is now facing a threat from terrorism. The right to access information and the relationship between journalists and security forces fighting terrorists remain sensitive. Fighting terrorism in a way that is respectful of human rights, civil liberties and freedom of expression is a key challenge facing the young Tunisian democracy.

2. Findings

2.1. Relevance > HIGH

The target groups were the following: 1) members of the National Constituent Assembly (NCA) and members of the Parliament; 2) journalist professional associations and civil society organizations specialized on press freedom; 3) media managers, associative radios and journalists; 4) national policy makers and the Ministry of Interior (including members of regional security forces).

UNESCO managed to adapt the intervention logic of the project to the specificity and the evolution of the Tunisian context and the evolution of needs of the different target groups. Initially, support was provided to strengthening the legal and regulatory framework conducive to freedom of expression, press freedom and freedom of information. After the adoption of the new Tunisian Constitution (27 January 2014) the focus was placed on the electoral process. Started in 2013, the programme tackled the challenging relationship between journalists and the security forces, which was one of the main sources of aggression against journalists.

UNESCO took into account the activities of other development actors to avoid duplication of activities. The project does not provide support to web radios, a target group that already received significant support from other donors and organisations.

A gender-sensitive approach was ensured across the different activities. A specific gender component was planned and implemented with the community radio stations in partnership with UN Women and the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), focusing on the equal representation of women in their programmes. Training was provided on the right to education and work, rural women's rights, and the prevention of violence against women. The study for elections and political pluralism by the HAICA used a gender-responsive approach and showed significant gender differentials.

2.2. Efficiency > HIGH

The planning for activities was respected and most outputs were delivered on time. The delay in the discussion/adoption of some bills in the Parliament and in the NCA before 2014 had a spill-over effect in the implementation of some project activities on strengthening the legal framework in relation with the protection of freedom of expression, the press, and the right to information. In 2015, training sessions in the region (outside the capital of Tunis) were delayed or postponed after the increased security risk in Tunisia, following the terrorist attacks in March and June 2015. UNESCO Staff

demonstrates a high degree of flexibility allowing adaptation of activities to changing circumstances.

The funds from donors were available on time and the resources were used efficiently. The approach and mechanisms used by UNESCO staff in the regional office allowed the production of the expected outputs with the best quality-price ratio. Stakeholders noted that human resources at the Tunis office were qualified but the number is insufficient in relation to their needs.

UN Women and the OHCHR gave a partial financial support to some of the activities. They perceived their participation as a useful contribution to the achievement of the targeted actions.

Coordination and communication with UNESCO Headquarters (HQ) and with the regional office in Rabat was excellent. The managerial support provided to the Tunisian office was effective in strengthening synergies under the two projects' components.

2.3. Effectiveness > HIGH

All planned activities were implemented. There was an active participation in the planned events and celebrations: World Press Freedom Day, International Day Against Impunity and other regional events.

The expected outputs were properly achieved to a high quality:

- training sessions for CSOs activists, representatives of the ministries and journalists;
- training for 260 officers of the security forces (National Guard and Police) in Tunis and the regions on matters of freedom of expression, journalists' role in democracy, safety of journalists;
- high quality manuals available to be downloaded for free and in print version in Arabic and French;
- public awareness-raising campaigns;
- radio reports produced during the training sessions delivered to the 6 community radio stations related to gender;
- video about the project.

These outputs led to the achievement of ER1, ER2, ER4 and ER5 for the Sida project and ER1, ER4, ER5, ER7 and ER8 for the Finland project. A good needs assessment was the main factor that influenced and helped the achievement of these results.

The Ministry of Interior was involved in the project and participated actively in the awareness-raising activities on freedom of expression and safety of journalists.

UNESCO is perceived as more credible and neutral than other agencies. The beneficiaries expressed their preference to work with UNESCO rather than with other international organisations in this field. UN partner agencies are satisfied by the amount of beneficiaries that were supported by the project.

Effective monitoring mechanisms were in place to track project success and adhere to results indicators. UNESCO used the internal reporting database "SISTER". Tunis UNESCO office provided monthly reporting to the regional UNESCO office in Rabat and to the projects' coordinator at UNESCO headquarters in Paris.

2.4. Impact > HIGH

The project implemented in Tunisia contributed to the achievement of Immediate Objectives 1, 2, 4, 5, and 6 for the Sida project and Immediate Objectives 1, 2, 3 and 4 for the Finland project. As a consequence, it greatly contributed to the achievement of the Overall Objective of both projects.

The main long-term effects achieved by the projects are the following:

- In addition to the fundamental rights and freedoms, the current Tunisian constitution guarantees freedoms of expression, of opinion and of information. These achievements are the result of national and international efforts. UNESCO action played a key role in creating

awareness and strengthening competencies of CSOs and decision makers in this field.

- UNESCO's work supported the development of a Tunisian legal framework conducive to a free, open and media pluralism :
 - the new Tunisian constitution established a legal framework for matters of freedom of expression, freedom of the press and access to information that complies with international norms on fundamental freedoms following UNESCO's recommendations;
 - UNESCO greatly supported HAICA since its inception by providing technical expertise and facilitating the cooperation and exchanges with other international media regulation bodies. UNESCO supported the advocacy for the adoption of Decree law 116 which created HAICA;
 - on March 2016 the Assembly of People's Representatives of Tunisia passed the organic Law on the Right of Access to Information (No. 22 of 2016). UNESCO greatly contributed to this process since 2012.
- UNESCO assisted the electoral process with capacity building and awareness raising activities. As a result, the role of media as a space for free, independent and pluralistic democratic debate in Tunisia was reinforced and media capacity to cover the election campaign in a professional manner was increased.
- UNESCO played a key role in reducing the tension between security forces and journalists. The training sessions organised in partnership with the Tunisian Ministry of Interior enabled a mutual understanding of each other's role and enabled them both to do their jobs with a mutual respect. A dedicated manual "Freedom of Expression and Public Order" for security forces, available in Arabic, French and English was produced with UNESCO support. According to RSF 2016 World Press Freedom Index, Tunisia is ranked 96th of 180, thus improving its position by 30 places in one year.

The project did not create any unintended or negative long term effect.

2.5. Sustainability–Management–Governance > HIGH

The following benefits from the project are likely to be maintained after its finalisation:

1. the new Tunisian constitution establishes a legal framework that complies with international norms on freedom of expression, freedom of the press and access to information;
2. the organic Law on the Right of Access to Information was adopted in March 2016;
3. the creation and the strengthening of the media regulatory body. HAICA is now in a position to act and to regulate the media landscape in Tunisia;
4. relations between Tunisian security forces and journalists have improved and the National Guard training centre has integrated UNESCO's training manual "Freedom of expression and Public Order" into their officers' curriculum;
5. capacity of local radio stations has increased;
6. the raised awareness concerning the right for freedom of expression is a positive factor contributing to sustainability of project benefits;
7. the project received support from the President of the Republic showing the political will to anchor freedom of expression and journalist safety in the Tunisian traditions.

The international donor community gives a high priority to support freedom of expression and the media in Tunisia. The EU has several large technical assistance projects in the pipeline to reinforce the media sector in Tunisia (10 Million €).

1. Context of Libya

Following the revolution in Libya in 2011 and the fall of the dictatorship, citizen journalism became more widespread and media outlets multiplied in number and reflected a certain amount of diversity. Nevertheless, media freedom remains limited, subjected to serious constraints in an environment where the rule of law was consistently weak.

Libya held national elections for a Constituent Assembly in February 2014 followed by the drafting of a new Constitution, by a series of municipal elections in April and House of Representatives elections in June of the same year. The legitimacy of the newly elected House of Representative was challenged and this dispute led to a civil war leading the country to be divided between two governments (one on the East and one on the West). Despite a UN Security Council resolution that called for a cease-fire and international efforts to reach an end to the fighting, the situation is still sensitive and exacerbated by the terrorist threat of ISIS. Most of the foreign embassies and staff of International organizations were evacuated from Tripoli mid-July 2014.

Objective and neutral reporting became dangerous. Journalists and media outlets fear reprisals from armed groups and fall into self-censorship. The main media outlets took position with one of the warring parties and became part of the conflict. A significant number of journalists left the country.

2. Findings

2.1. Relevance > HIGH

UNESCO identified correctly the target groups: 1) media managers, media owners and journalists established both in Libya and abroad (mainly in Egypt, Jordan, Malta, and Tunisia) and 2) Libyan population at large.

The entire media environment in which UNESCO interventions were planned has been drastically altered by the crisis in 2014; sectoral priorities have changed completely and the increasingly polarizing stance taken by various media brought a new dynamic in the rise of “hate speech”. Characterized by the lack of independence and professionalism and having close ties with the warring parties, media is widely acknowledge as “adding fuel to the fire” in this conflict.

Since 2014, UNESCO has managed to adapt the intervention logic of the projects to the specificity of the Libyan context, meeting these emerging challenges through new activities aimed to bring the different media factions together to agree on basic professional and ethical standards so as to reduce the level of hate speech.

There is no independent editorial line for the Libyan media outlets; media managers and owners tend to impose their views on journalists. Thus determining that to work only with reporters and journalists was insufficient, UNESCO staff chose to apply a parallel top down and bottom up approach, addressing both decision-makers and practitioners at the same time.

While no specific gender component was planned owing to the nature of the intervention (i.e. dialogue with selected influential stakeholders as opposed to an inclusive capacity-building programme), gender-awareness was integrated in the activities to promote a culture of peace and dialogue, and in particular concerning female journalists. The project tried to enhance the participation and role of women by inviting female journalists to attend project related activities (Amman, Madrid, Tunis and Vienna).

The in-kind contributions received from other donors (USA, Spain and Austria) to support project outputs provide a good indicator of the relevance of the programme.

2.2. Efficiency > HIGH

Planning of activities was globally respected and the resources were used efficiently. Funds from donors were available and planned activities were implemented on time. It should be noted that the budget is modest compared to the delivered outputs.

The evacuation of the UNESCO Tripoli office to Tunis in 2014 understandably led to some complications in project management. On the positive side it allowed the conduct of joint activities with Tunisian journalists and media, which contributed to the efficiencies of the project.

The most significant challenges in project implementation were related to the dispersion of Libyan journalists across the region, the cancellation of international flights to Libya and the extreme political sensitivities present amongst the beneficiaries. Despite this, the experience, expertise and determination of the programme officer was able to overcome this deficiency.

The coordination and communication with UNESCO Headquarters (HQ) was satisfactory but it is too early to conclude the new arrangements with the UNESCO regional office in Cairo which came into effect in March 2016.

2.3. Effectiveness > HIGH

Most of the planned activities were implemented as expected.

The expected outputs were properly achieved with a high quality:

1. Media-Security Dialogue (February and April 2014): workshops to facilitate dialogue between Libyan media professionals and the security forces represented by the Ministry of the Interior.
2. The Madrid 1 and Madrid 2 conferences (July and October 2015) and Vienna workshop (Feb 2016) were well conducted; the number of participants was limited but included participants with all different political sympathies;
3. UNESCO staff showed good skills in the facilitation of the dialogue in the media sector and keeping it focused on the planned goals, which was appreciated by the participants;
4. There was an active participation in the planned events and celebrations: World Press Freedom Day, International Day Against Impunity and other regional events; new activities were added as required, such as a workshop in Vienna (to launch the Madrid Follow-Up Working Group) with a focus on strategic planning for the media sector;
5. Training conducted in late April 2016 in Amman, Jordan, supported the training of Libyan journalists on conflict-sensitive reporting and resulted in the establishment of a draft Code of Ethics for Libyan journalists.

In 2016 the celebration of the World Press Freedom in May did not take place due to the late return of participants from the Amman workshops and the urgent requirement to beginning planning of Madrid III scheduled for the end of that same month. The Libyans achievements however were specifically highlighted and discussed during the global commemorations in Helsinki.

These above outputs led to the achievement of Expected Results (ER) 1, ER2, ER4 and ER5 for the Sida project and ER1 for the Finland project. The ER2 for the Finland project was not achieved because of the war situation in Libya.

Effective monitoring mechanisms were in place to track project success and adhere to results indicators. UNESCO used an internal reporting database "SISTER", while Libya UNESCO office maintained continuous contact with the projects' coordinator at HQ.

UNESCO has significant credibility in Libya and is perceived as more neutral than other donors/agencies because it is perceived as having the same distance with the different actors.

Beneficiaries were satisfied by the quality of the training, the spirit on consensus and the mutual respect that was present during all training sessions despite immense political divergence of the participants.

Donors and partners are satisfied by the amount of beneficiaries that were supported by the project.

2.4. Impact > HIGH

The project implemented in Libya contributed to the achievement of Immediate Objectives 1, 2, 4, 5, for the Sida project and Immediate Objectives 1, 2 and 4 for the Finland project. As a consequence, it greatly contributed to the achievement of the Overall Objective of both projects. The main long-term effects achieved by the project are the following:

1. UNESCO Libya succeeded to bring around the same table actors from the warring parties working together during 4 days and the subsequent adoption of a common declaration (the Madrid Declaration – end July 2015);
2. The Madrid Declaration publicly proclaimed the commitment of the media directors and media owners to work together to reform the Libyan media landscape with a view to adherence to professional norms and international standards. It was elaborated over days of intensive discussions and consultations and outlines a set of principles to which the signatories (media directors and media owners) agree to abide. It recognises the key role played by the media in Libya and affirms their commitment to promote freedom of expression, responsible journalism and the absolute rejection of all forms of hate speech and incitement to violence;
3. The Madrid Declaration has become a sectoral reference point respected by many Libyan stakeholders, even those who did not sign it;
4. A monitoring activity on the Libyan media conducted by UNESCO Libya in 2016 showed a real (factual) decrease in the use of “hate speech” among the signatories of the Madrid Declaration;
5. A significant decrease of “hate speech” was also observed by the local and international stakeholders on the media channels who signed the Madrid Declaration. This impact is mainly thanks to the project.
6. A similar effect is expected from the proposed Code of Ethics for Libyan Journalists and Media Professionals which was elaborated in Amman in April 2016.

The project did not create any unintended or negative long term effect.

2.5. Sustainability–Management–Governance> MEDIUM-HIGH

The benefits from the project are likely to be maintained after its finalisation:

The Madrid Declaration has become a sectoral reference point respected by many Libyan stakeholders, even those who have not yet signed it; both journalists and citizens are criticising media that does not respect the Madrid Declaration;

The concept of media self-regulation is becoming accepted within the sector.

There is a high chance that the Madrid Declaration will be sustainable. The strength of this statement is that it does not need money and funds to continue to exist. The principles were appropriated by the Libyan stakeholders and the Declaration is beginning to be appreciated by the citizens.

A monitoring body for the Madrid Declaration is needed to maintain the benefits of the project; this can be implemented with minimal financial resources.

The Libyan actors understood the importance of standards and are now more committed to a media self-regulation body. The HAICA could be an example to replicate.

The project has received written acknowledgements from the Presidency Council of the Government of National Accord, the House of Representatives, key municipalities and respected personalities in Libya.

1. Context of Yemen

The overall Human Rights situation in Yemen significantly deteriorated in 2015. Human rights violations and abuses took place on a large scale. On July 2015, the UN declared Yemen to be at Level 3 emergency status, making the crisis in Yemen one of the large-scale humanitarian crises in the world. In a generalized context of insecurity, with the civil war between supporters of former President Mansour Hadi and Houthi rebels, kidnappings, violence and terrorist acts, threats are the daily lot of Yemeni journalists when they are not victims of the bombings of the Arab coalition.

Aside of the security situation, the conflict in Yemen has strongly divided the Yemeni media landscape into polarized groups based on political affiliations and alliances with the warring parties. Freedom of speech is subject to government and other armed groups censorship and to violence towards journalists and media outlets. In 2016, Yemen ranked 170th out of 180 nations in the 2016 World Press Freedom Index published by Reporters without borders, dropping 2 places compared to 2015. As per UNESCO's Director General condemnations of killings of journalists from January 2016 up until today, Yemen is the worse country for journalists to report in with 7 Yemeni journalists killed since the beginning of the year.

2. Findings

2.1. Relevance > HIGH

The project produced three surveys that helped to define the target groups and to assess their needs: a survey on the priority needs of Yemeni journalists, a poll on audience information needs and a mapping of the media landscape in Yemen. UNESCO staff identified correctly the target groups:

1. Affiliated and freelance journalists, social media and blogger activists and new graduates;
2. CSOs working for freedom of expression. An important part of the journalists in Yemen think that the existing media channels are partisan and if they have to work with them they will be perceived also as partisan journalists and will lose their neutrality. These journalists prefer to work with the CSOs;
3. Yemeni population at large, suffering from the lack of credible and useful information during this humanitarian crisis.

The initial approach based on the Media Development Indicators (MDI) for the improvement of the Yemeni media context changed completely with the outbreak of war (March 2015). The ERs lost their relevance and the focus of the project switched to the role of media to inform the population in a war situation and the safety of journalists in a conflict zone. The project answered these new needs, mainly through the participation of journalists in the Lifeline programme, a special media programme for communities affected by a humanitarian crisis, and series of trainings on occupational and digital safety for Yemeni journalists.

These new needs were expressed by the journalists following consultations with the journalists inside and outside Yemen and confirmed by the Survey on the Priority Needs of Yemeni Journalists conducted by UNESCO Yemen. The project led to the launch of an Action Plan supported by 20 international NGOs and 60 Yemeni journalists and media representatives to support Yemeni media in promoting peace and dialogue. No specific gender component was planned, but the project tried to enhance the participation and strengthen the role of women journalists by ensuring maximum gender balance during activities.

2.2. Efficiency > HIGH

The funds from donors were available on time. The planning of activities was respected and the resources were used efficiently. The planned activities were implemented on time and realised in a cost-efficient way. UNESCO staff opted to reduce international travel by combining several activities together in the same period and location and prioritising regional activities. When the safety situation allowed it, UNESCO prioritized action on the ground by working with trusted local partners in Yemen to implement activities inside the country and in difficult areas, while guaranteeing the safety of its partners and beneficiaries. Some activities were organised with other UN Agencies.

The outbreak of war in March 2015 forced numerous NGOs and UN agencies to leave Yemen. This greatly limited UNESCO's access to the country and to its beneficiaries, creating additional difficulties to work with the journalists inside Yemen, including logistical and administrative issues for travel of the journalists. For several months, Yemen's two international airports were shut down which completely prevented access to the country. Since August 2015, the only international airport serving Yemen was Amman so any international travel had to pass through that city and new visa procedures for Yemeni nationals were put in place in December 2015, ending the visa-free policy for Yemeni citizens entering Jordan. Having representation in Amman, where all UN agencies working in Yemen relocated, specifically for UNESCO's work in Yemen to provide logistical support would have facilitated the process though considerable support was received from UNESCO Amman Office.

The biggest difficulties in the project implementation were related to the outbreak of the war, the closure of international airports in Yemen, the lack of mobility for Yemeni journalists within Yemen and outside the country, and security threats for beneficiaries involved in the project.

However, since May 2016, UNESCO was one of the first international organizations in the area of media development and freedom of expression to be able to organize activities inside Yemen again despite the ongoing war and with the support of trusted local partners. A series of activities on safety were therefore implemented inside Yemen to answer the most urgent needs of journalists working in the front line. Coordination and communication with UNESCO Headquarters (HQ) and with the regional office in Doha was excellent and they provided the necessary technical support on sensitive issues such as personal security.

2.3. Effectiveness > MEDIUM-HIGH

Main outputs of the projects were:

1. Two activities were achieved in December 2014 in Amman: training and workshop for journalists, academics and media experts on best practices for media regulatory frameworks and integrating international standards and good practices into media policies. The training was useful and well perceived by the participants;
2. In February 2016 a 3-day workshop on Lifeline programming was organised in Amman for 35 journalists and media experts representing various media organisations and outlets in Yemen. The training was provided by BBC Media Action;
3. The February workshop was directly followed by a 2-day meeting entitled "Supporting Yemeni Media in Promoting Peace and Dialogue" that brought together 20 international and regional media support groups, along with around 55 representatives of Yemen's media to identify the priority areas and emerging needs of the media sector in Yemen and to discuss a common strategy to support them. A 7 minute video on the project was published in May 2016.
4. In May 2016, the Action Plan on Supporting Yemeni Media on Promoting Peace and Dialogue was launched with a support website to serve as an information platform for partners to follow up on implementation of the plan. Coordination of the overall plan led by UNESCO.
5. Launch of series of safety workshops in May and June 2016 inside Yemen to reinforce the safety of Yemeni journalists including 5-day training of trainers for hostile environment training for 3 heads of local media development NGOs working with journalists, a 5-day occupational and digital safety training in Sana'a for 15 journalists and a 4-day hostile environment training in

Taiz for 10 journalists reporting directly from Taiz, a city currently under siege.

6. Publication of digital safety guidelines in cooperation with local partner and shared with network of Yemeni journalists
7. Publication of series of videos of testimonies and recommendations by Yemeni journalists on the importance of safety (to be published end of June 2016)
8. June 5-day workshop “BTelephony” on reporting with mobile phones and safety for 15 Yemeni journalists in Sana’a to develop alternative media platforms and encourage Yemeni journalists to report information in a safer, innovative way

The training provided by BBC Media Action was highly appreciated by the participants. Extensive discussions during the ensuing 2-day meeting resulted in recommendations which formulated the basis for an action plan for future programmes supporting the media sector in Yemen. The Action was endorsed and published in June 2016.

These outputs led to the achievement of ER1, ER2 and ER4 for the Sida project. For the Finland project, the first stage of ER6 was implemented but couldn't be completed because of war.

Effective monitoring mechanisms were in place to track project successes and adhere to results indicators. UNESCO used an internal reporting database “SISTER”. UNESCO office for the GCC and Yemen provided monthly monitoring and reporting and maintained continuous contact with projects' coordinator at HQ. UNESCO in Yemen is perceived as a reliable and non-partisan actor in relation to the two parties in conflict. Interviewees reported a difference in the perception between UNESCO's credibility and some dissatisfaction with other UN agencies involved in humanitarian work.

2.4. Impact > MEDIUM-HIGH

The UNESCO project in Yemen contributed to the achievement of the Immediate Objectives (IO) 1, 2 and 4 for the Sida project and IO 1, 2 and 4 for the Finland project. As a consequence, it greatly contributed to the achievement of the Overall Objective of both projects.

The main long term effects of the project were :

1. Creating the basis for dialogue between the two warring parties. This is an ongoing process and journalists from different backgrounds and media outlets were able to find common ground on issues such as safety and professionalism;
2. Improving the relationship between journalists and the UN humanitarian agencies working together in Yemen;
3. Formulating the basis for an action plan for future programmes supporting media in Yemen.
4. Ensuring the safety of media professionals, citizen journalists and bloggers
5. Developing alternative media platforms and encourage Yemeni journalists to report information in a safer, innovative way

These benefits can be directly attributed to the UNESCO projects and are the result of the success of the training provided, workshops and meetings organised in Amman and of the concrete activities implemented in Sana’a and Taiz, in Yemen, to enhance the safety of Yemeni journalists. The project was able to have a direct impact inside Yemen after UNESCO managed to implement activities on the ground again, since the outbreak of the conflict in March 2015.

The professional knowledge of Yemeni media experts and journalists on media regulatory frameworks was increased, which may reinforce their capacity of integrating international standards and good practices into media policies. Similarly, the level of awareness among Yemeni journalists and local NGOs about the importance of safety planning and safety measures was raised and shared across journalists' networks. The UNESCO project, along with other international and local actors, was one of the contributors to this positive change. The project did not create any unintended or negative long term effect.

2.5. Sustainability–Management–Governance > MEDIUM

The main benefit of the project was to create dialogue between the two warring parties. It is likely to be sustained as the main obstacle of having all parties around the same table was achieved and the process can continue even with limited financial support. The improved relationship between journalists and humanitarian actors needs additional efforts to be maintained after project finalisation. The improved awareness about the importance of safety is likely to be sustained through continuous partnerships with international and local organizations to train Yemeni journalists and through the sharing of knowledge among journalists' networks in Yemen.

The Action Plan on Supporting Yemeni Media in promoting Peace and Dialogue is likely to contribute to sustainability in responding to the crisis and is leading to implementation of actions in a coordinated manner. The fact that, since May 2016, activities can now be implemented on the ground is a positive indicator of sustainability and will lead to a stronger impact on the Yemeni media sector. The project did not receive any additional financial support, neither local nor at the government level. The lack of financial resources of the target groups may impact negatively the sustainability of the benefits, especially for Yemeni journalists and independent media outlets in the country.

1. Context of Morocco

An evaluation based on UNESCO's Media development indicators (MDIs) is carried out to assess the media landscape in Morocco. Based on the relatively stable political context of the country it was decided to support the development and strengthening of media regulatory bodies and to encourage the democratic reform process in the country.

Morocco's 2011 revised Constitution has strengthened guarantees to freedom of the press and introduced the right to information, but the progress in the principles have yet to be fully translated into practice. The legislative framework for media contains a number of limits to independent coverage on certain issues considered taboo, while its ongoing reform has generated one of the most lively debate in the recent history of Morocco, with several draft laws proposed by the Government and then sparking years-long discussion within the Parliament and the civil society, animated by the representatives of the media, as well by specialized observers.

Awareness raising among policy makers is still necessary with regard to freedom of expression, freedom of the press and gender-equality. Safety of journalists (with a strong emphasis on women journalists) and advocacy on freedom of expression on the internet has still to be consolidated. Despite major achievements of the two projects in working on these issues in Morocco, restrictions remain in place which deters coverage of socio-politically sensitive subjects.

2. Findings

2.1. Relevance > HIGH

The target groups for both projects in Morocco are: 1) media professionals and bloggers, 2) CSOs specialising in press freedom and media development, 3) national policy makers working on media issues, 4) women (to ensure a gender-balanced participation in all activities, 5) the population at large.

Both projects were considered as complementary with overlapping ERs. The work under both projects focused on assisting the country in its democratic transition and addressing the legal context of the media environment. Activities were identified for high-ranking officials involved in the media landscape to be able to participate at regional forums organised by UNESCO (SIDA ER 1 and Finland ER 1) and to reinforce institutions fostering freedom of expression furthering democratic transition and consolidation (SIDA ER 6).

It was necessary to increase the capacities of actors involved in media law reform (SIDA ER 8) and protect freedom of expression over the internet (SIDA ER 4) while reinforcing professional skills of media practitioners (SIDA ER 7).

Promoting gender mainstreaming through training of media workers based on gender-sensitive media indicators (SIDA and Finland) and distribution of a media tool-kit was highly relevant in Morocco and contributes to UNESCO's Priority Gender Equality.

2.2. Efficiency > HIGH

The managerial support provided by the UNESCO regional office in Rabat was effective in strengthening synergies under these two projects and to ensure that outputs were delivered in a timely cost-efficient manner. There were no significant delays that impacted the activities in terms of timing. The risk of delay in general was taken into account and mitigated during the conceptualisation step of individual activities and a timetable was made with a realistic approach, according to the result-based management (RBM). The planning for activities was respected and the resources were used efficiently.

The UNESCO field office in Rabat strives to implement activities and optimize their impact in the most efficient way, even with a limited budget. An example of efficient use of funds was in March 2016, they had the possibility to devote \$10000 to training on gender issues for community media. Either they

could gather, with this budget, twenty participants from different cities for a two or three-day workshop in Rabat, or they could ask the trainer to make an itinerant training and move from one city to another and reinforce, during each session, the capacities of twenty journalists in their local environment. It was unanimously agreed by all partners that in this way the training would be able to target more people in their own environment and produce higher impact reaching a total of 200 beneficiaries from 10 cities with the same budget.

2.3. Effectiveness > MEDIUM-HIGH

All planned activities in Morocco were implemented and ERs were achieved. Main outputs of the two projects were:

1. Following the Constitutional reform in Morocco of July 2011 which set out to a) strengthen provisions on freedom of expression, b) provide a constitutional basis to the High Authority for Audiovisual Communication (HACA), and c) introduce the Right to access to information held by public bodies (FOI/RTI), three laws related to press freedom were discussed and approved by the Government's Council. This is part of the reform process promised by the Ministry of Communication. The laws were:
 - law n°89-13 related to the status of professional journalists
 - law n°90-13 related to the establishment of the National Press Council as a self/co-regulatory mechanism
 - law n°31-13 on press and publishing and access to information
2. UNESCO-supported website reporting violations on press freedom in Morocco was set up and became operational ([website reporting violations](#)). Training was provided to lawyers, journalists and CSO representatives in monitoring and reporting cases of violations of press members. The online platform will become a repository of cases to allow advocacy work on press freedom in Morocco. Beyond UNESCO's intervention, CSOs are committed to producing a yearly report reflecting such violations.
3. Seminar in February 2016 to present the study on "Web Radios in Morocco" prepared by an external expert was successfully conducted. It brought together 40 participants from different web radios including: Radio Campus Marrakesh, Radio Ajjal in Agadir, and e-Joussour in Rabat. The aim was to bring the need for a legal recognition of web radios to the attention of high-level attendees such as the managing director of HACA, the Chairman of World Association of Community-based Broadcasters and the Secretary-General of the Ministry of Communication of the Kingdom of Morocco. The capacity building of 10 web radios in media skills had a positive effect with 200 people trained in total.
4. Gender sensitive reporting: Regular newsletters produced by the UNESCO office in Rabat ([Gender and media analysis](#)), plus an infographic on gender sensitive reporting which disseminated among 300 newsrooms across the Maghreb region, cooperation agreement was reached between HACA and UN Women assisted by UNESCO, and a Regional Conference "Les femmes font l'info" was held in Casablanca in April 2015.
5. High-level celebration of World Press Freedom Day (WPF) in Morocco with presence of the President and the Director-General of HACA, the Minister of Communication, and leaders of the Moroccan Journalists Union.

These outputs led to the achievement of ER 1, 2, 3 and 5 of the SIDA project and ER 1, 3, and 11 of the Finland project.

Project partners and beneficiaries met were satisfied with the project results.

Effective monitoring mechanisms were in place to track project success and adhere to results indicators. UNESCO used an internal reporting database linked to contracts called SISTER, regional UNESCO offices maintained continuous contact with the projects' coordinator at HQ and with other regional UNESCO offices, and consolidated progress reports were prepared by HQ for both projects.

UNESCO is considered a credible convener. It provides high-level reinforcement to support CSOs active in the sector of freedom of expression and promote democratic progress. Neutrality is the

comparative advantage of UNESCO which allows it to maintain an equally good relationship with regulators, institutions and CSOs. The UNESCO logo gives reassurance to the partners and added credibility whereas EU can be viewed as having a “hidden” agenda, particularly in Morocco where there have been strained relations since early 2016. ([EEAS statement](#))

2.4. Impact > MEDIUM-HIGH

The project contributed to the Immediate Objectives (IOs) 1, 2, 3, 4, and 6 for the SIDA funded project and IOs 1, 2, 3 and 4 of the Finland project, thereby supporting the Overall Objective (OO) of both projects.

In terms of impact,

- The laws approved by the Government in Morocco demonstrate progress toward strengthening press freedom and access to information, but they have been criticised by watchdogs such as Transparency International and Article 19 as falling short of international standards and lacking sufficient consultation with civil society. Decriminalisation of media activities is part of the new Constitution but long term effects of the action will require improvements to the laws and their implementation.
- UNESCO-supported website reporting violations on press freedom in Morocco is a useful tool but is not meant to prevent journalists from prosecution.
- In Morocco, the current legal framework of the media sector does not allow the web radios to have a presence on the radio and is currently available only on the internet. Capacity building of web radios and support in their advocacy work has helped beneficiaries get involved in democratic transition and has put in place a professional cadre of trained web radios.
- Visibility of WPF and promotion of expression of freedom will provide longer term benefits for the public in Morocco.

No negative effects of the activities were observed.

2.5. Sustainability–Management–Governance > MEDIUM-HIGH

Training of Trainers workshops that were conducted by UNESCO are an important factor of sustainability of the project benefits in the longer term. The momentum to transform the results of the projects into sustained action in Morocco exists, but it is a first phase. Morocco’s press currently has limited mechanisms of regulatory independence and more work needs to be done on this issue by UNESCO and other independently funded non-profit organisations working to support local media in countries affected by political transition.

Bringing together different actors from the media community with government representatives reflects the successful advocacy work of UNESCO in Morocco but consolidation of the actions is still needed. Projects such as the civil society web portal: e-Joussour.net set up for the Maghreb/Mashrek region and supported by UNESCO is a means of contributing to sustainability of project benefits and contributing to reinforcing local ownership of the reform process. Much work still needs to be done to make gender sensitive reporting in Morocco mainstream but the newsletter and infographics provide useful indicators to monitor progress.

1. Context of Egypt

Egypt has more than 500 newspapers and journals and the state retains ownership of several important titles. In October 2014 the chief editors of 17 private and state-owned newspapers pledged to refrain from criticizing the government, the army, or other national institutions. Journalists at both state-owned and private outlets who express even the slightest criticism of the regime suffer repercussions from the government or from their employers. The authorities continue to arrest and prosecute editors and journalists so freedom of expression in Egypt is not currently viable.

The Constitution brought into effect in 2014, following the regime change, includes provisions regarding freedom of expression, access to information, and the media. These include Article 65 which guarantees freedom of thought and freedom of expression, and Articles 70, 71, and 72 that govern the press, providing for many of the rights that support a free media environment. However, these articles include loopholes that are used to prosecute journalists, editors and human rights activists and to prevent freedom of expression.

The Constitution also mentions the need for independent regulatory bodies but does not define procedures on how to ensure their independence.

2. Findings

2.1. Relevance > HIGH

Only so much can be done in the field of promoting an enabling environment for freedom of expression in Egypt given the political situation. Nevertheless, the project activities implemented in Egypt managed to address the main needs of the target groups, many of which were identified prior to the regime change.

The target groups in Egypt are 1) media professionals, 2) CSOs specialising in press freedom, 3) national policy makers and ministries working on media issues, 4) members of the security forces, 5) women (to ensure a gender-balanced approach in activities), 6) the population at large.

Raising awareness on Media Information Literacy (MIL) (ER 4 of the SIDA funded project) was seen as a priority area where the project was able to progress. Increasing capacities of and networking among actors involved in media law (ER 1 SIDA project) is highly relevant. UNESCO's close partnership with Cairo university was a means of promoting local ownership of the actions.

Gender-sensitive indicators were not introduced (ER 11 Finland project) despite the best efforts of the UNESCO office in Cairo to do so. The UNESCO regional office in Cairo wished the American university in Cairo (who implemented first phase of the Finland project) to implement it but the contractual process failed due to some technical issues and social and political situation.

2.2. Efficiency > MEDIUM

It can be considered that UNESCO managed the funds available to them in an efficient manner. Project funds were received on time to implement activities.

Most of the implemented activities were delayed due to the political situation. The UNESCO office in Cairo was able to continue to implement a number of activities related to advocacy work on MIL and advocacy work related to media law despite the lack of an enabling environment to promote freedom of expression in Egypt.

2.3. Effectiveness > MEDIUM-LOW

Not all planned activities were implemented due to the political changes which could not be foreseen at the time of drafting the ToR of the two projects. Egypt is not currently on the path to democratic reform. High level support to the project initiatives were offered at the outset but the political situation changed twice and actions such as introducing gender sensitive indicators and following up on reforms to the media law became difficult to implement.

Main outputs of the two projects were achieved in five key areas:

1. Advocacy work on MIL in the region. The UNESCO office in Cairo produced the Arabic version of the MIL kit with a consultation process at a conference on "MIL and Democracy in the Arab World" held at Cairo University in 2013. The UNESCO office also organised a seminar on the MIL kit in the Middle Eastern and Northern Africa (MENA) region in 2014 with the objective of raising awareness on MIL among policy makers/university professors/education planners/educationalists and to encourage them to integrate the curricula into secondary school education. As a result, awareness was raised on MIL among policy makers and integrating the MIL curricula into the secondary school education is under serious consideration in the Arab speaking countries.
2. The UNESCO office in Cairo also organised the Regional Forum on MIL in Arab States in Cairo in 2015 with over 140 participants from 14 countries of Arab region. Participants included policy makers, curriculum experts, educators, and media and information experts. As a result, the Arab Chapter of Global Alliance on Partnerships on MIL was launched at the Regional Forum as well as a detailed action plan for the Arab States GAPMIL Chapter. [GAPMIL Regional Chapter](#)
3. Advocacy work on media law in Egypt. 3 workshops focusing on media law and the right to access to information were run in 2014 to support media independence and the strengthening of legal guarantees for journalists in the country. 74 people were trained (31% women) with 15 organisations represented in each workshop. A seminar was organised in 2015 on Media Policies and Freedom of Expression in Egypt with participation of 50 experts which highlighted the results of the initiatives and presented them to the Egyptian media and public at large. As a result, a network of media professionals sensitized about press freedom and freedom of expression was established
4. Publication in 2013 of an Assessment of Media Development in Egypt based on UNESCO's Media Development Indicators (MDIs). The work was a comprehensive analysis of the media landscape and legal context in Egypt at that moment in time to be used as a toolkit and reference for necessary reforms. [Assessment of Media Development in Egypt](#)
5. Workshop aimed at strengthening the rights of community media workers resulted in a set of recommendations aiming to legalise the status of internet radios was presented for consideration to the Constitution Amendment Committee. As a result, a network of stakeholders was set up who are interested in the development of necessary legislation for enabling community media in Egypt. [Community radios workshop](#). The workshop moderator and general director of the Institute for Tolerance and Anti-Violence Studies was arrested in 2015 for running a community radio.

Outcome achievement was limited in Egypt. Not all ERs of the projects could be addressed. These outputs led to the achievement of ER1 and ER4 for the Sida project and ER1 and ER7 for the Finland project. ER10 and ER12 for the Finland project were not included in the workplan for UNESCO Egypt office as they were not considered achievable by Headquarters due to the political situation in the country.

Final beneficiaries could not be interviewed in the field, but according to consulted stakeholders, they are satisfied with the results of the activities that were implemented.

Credibility of UNESCO to deliver these activities and bring about albeit limited results was important especially at a time when the government announced during this period that all international aid projects were put on hold.

Effective monitoring mechanisms were in place to track project success and adhere to results indicators. UNESCO used an internal reporting database linked to contracts called SISTER, regional UNESCO offices maintained continuous contact with the projects' coordinator at HQ and with other

regional UNESCO offices, and consolidated progress reports were prepared by HQ for both projects.

2.4. Impact > MEDIUM-LOW

The project contributed to the Immediate Objectives (IOs) 1, 3 and 4 of the SIDA funded project and IOs 1 and 3 of the Finland project, thereby supporting the Overall Objective (OO) of both projects.

The project held several regional events that contributed to building a network of campaigners in media freedom that includes editors, journalists and civil society activists. A number of local media professionals were trained and a few of them went on to become members of committees on media law as well as a specialised advisory group on media-self-regulation (which was later disbanded). Impact in the future depends on the evolution of the country towards embracing democracy and journalists and editors being able to work without fear of reprisal.

2.5. Sustainability–Management–Governance > LOW

Sustainability of the project's benefits depends on a decision by the government to proceed with some of the achievements of the project. Although some of the achievements were driven by civil society initiatives the risk of arrest reduces the ability of civil society to build on these achievements for the moment. Additional donor funding is not currently required according to interviews held with project stakeholders.

The projects received the support of important stakeholders from the beginning: for example, the Head of school of law and politics at American University became Minister of Foreign Affairs two weeks after UNESCO Cairo office met him and he pledged his support to the projects' objectives.

1. Context of Lebanon

Despite profound difficulties and constant threats affecting the Lebanese media landscape, journalists continue to report in relatively free conditions compared to surrounding Arab countries. The country ranked 98 in the 2016 World Press Freedom Index (produced by Reporters without Borders), the second best position among the 9 countries targeted by the evaluated projects. Tunisia was first in position 96 and Syria ranked 177, the last position of the group.

Lebanese journalists seem to be the most lively and active in the Arab world. However, the near absence of State policies to protect the profession renders journalists defenceless against the oligopoly of a few media tycoons. During the recent years of harsh internal political confrontation, most of Lebanon's media seem to have neglected their role and responsibility as promoters of freedom, instead becoming the first tool of conflict among the political, religious, military, and financial forces. Lebanese media have declined in terms of freedom and balanced coverage.

The media landscape is affected by an overwhelming sectarianism and a highly volatile regional scenario. Violence and instability from the Syrian conflict bled into Lebanon, compounding domestic issues that restricted the press. Authorities reportedly beaten, detained, and/or confiscated equipment while journalists covered bombings or clashes. Some bloggers/citizen journalists were sentenced to jail for political commentaries posted online, and several others were summoned to security offices for questioning in similar circumstances.

Last but not least, the Lebanese media has been hit by the financial crisis that the whole country is facing. Moreover, we have seen institutions closing as well as media workers being laid off. This has also affected the overall performance of journalists and hence, the content in some cases.

2. Findings

2.1. Relevance > HIGH

The main groups targeted in Lebanon were the following: 1) young journalists, media students and staff from media/election-related CSOs; 2) Syrian refugees, with a special focus on youth and women; and 3) the Lebanese population at large, particularly youth and women. UNESCO's flexibility to adapt the activities within the defined objectives allowed for a good targeting of the real needs of the target groups.

The projects correctly addressed the need to strengthen the technical capacities of journalists and the need to raise journalistic ethical standards. Importance was given to safeguarding and promoting freedom of expression and press freedom (SIDA ER 1 and 3), enhancing the safety of journalists and combating impunity of crimes committed against them (SIDA ER 2). Activities also aimed at building journalist capacities on electoral reporting with a human rights approach (SIDA ER1).

Important needs of the Syrian displaced community were addressed, in line with Finland ER13. The project aimed at increasing the general access of the Syrian displaced population to communication tools and skills as well as to relevant humanitarian information and tried to give a stronger voice to this community in the Lebanese media. By addressing these needs through various channels (radio and Youth Information Centres), the project intended to alleviate the distress of this community and to improve its social integration within Lebanese society.

Certain imminent needs of the Lebanese population were correctly addressed, with project activities aimed to strengthen freedom of expression and press freedom in addition to enhance human capacities (SIDA ER1) and to improve the quality of media coverage on electoral processes (SIDA ER1).

Several activities contributed to UNESCO's Priority Gender Equality, in line with SIDA ER5: i) in the training and conferences that were organised, the majority of participants were women; ii) capacity-building training and sessions aiming to enhance the role of women were conducted in the Youth Information Centres (YIC) and computer classes for women were organised along with information sessions about violence against women; iii) the majority of volunteers in the YICs are women; iv) model

course on the safety of journalists mainstreamed a gender-sensitive approach.

2.2. Efficiency > HIGH

Funds from donors were available on time. UNESCO worked closely with its partners and applied regular internal procedures and guidelines during planning and implementation to ensure that resources were used efficiently. The decentralised management of the projects' budget by the Beirut office ensured a good cost-efficiency of the resources. More outputs than initially planned were achieved thanks to the financial contribution of the partners. For example, the UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) distributed 1000 radio units to 1000 Syrian families, an expenditure which was not initially foreseen. In addition to an important contribution (both financial & in-kind) that was done by World Vision that allowed the expansion of the original YIC to three YIC in different areas in Lebanon.

All planned activities were implemented and there were no significant delays in the delivery of the expected outputs.

There was good coordination and communication between UNESCO Headquarters (HQ) and the UNESCO office in Beirut. There was also a good coordination with UNESCO's regional coordinator (initially based in Tunis and later at HQ). The coordination mechanisms and contractual arrangements between UNESCO and its partners were conducive for achieving the ERs.

2.3. Effectiveness > HIGH

All planned activities were implemented. Main outputs of the two projects were:

1. A model course on the safety of journalists was created for universities in the Arab region and was launched at the celebration of World Press Freedom Day (WPFDD) 2016 in Helsinki;
2. A first ever comprehensive Arabic-language online course and open curriculum for independent media covering several issues (freedom of expression, gender-sensitive mainstreaming, ethical standards of journalists, technical skills, investigative journalism) was produced;
3. A weekly radio programme targeting displaced Syrian youth was produced by Radio Voice of Lebanon and was accompanied by journalistic and technical capacity building and activities for 12 youth, 5 of whom went on to become correspondents;
4. Three YIC benefiting young Syrian refugees and host communities were established in Kfarzabad, Qobayat and Khiam villages, offering computer lab, library services as well as common space for awareness, integration and capacity building to its users;
5. Training of 25 journalism students carried out on safety of journalists (international humanitarian laws, kidnapping and hostage situations, personal safety and first aid);
6. A training on media electoral coverage delivered by Information International for journalists;
7. Several conferences and events (including local activities for WPFDD) on free press, freedom of expression and Internet freedom were organised in the country.

These outputs led to the achievement of ER13 for the Finland project and ER1, ER2, ER3 and ER5 for the Sida project.

The ability of UNESCO to find the relevant partners to carry out the planned activities and the good collaboration with the local authorities were positive factors of achievement. The evaluation team did not have the possibility to speak with any final beneficiary during the field visit, but according to the consulted stakeholders, the beneficiaries were very satisfied with the achieved results.

UNESCO is perceived as a credible and neutral actor, something that is particularly valuable taking into account the deep sectarian and political divides affecting Lebanon.

Effective monitoring mechanisms were in place to track project success and adhere to results indicators. UNESCO used an internal reporting database linked to contracts called SISTER, regional UNESCO offices maintained continuous contact with the projects' coordinator at HQ and with other regional UNESCO offices. The monitoring was done jointly by UNESCO and its partners. Some of the

partners conducted regular surveys to monitor and assess the effectiveness of the activities that were implemented.

2.4. Impact > MEDIUM-HIGH

The project contributed to the Immediate Objectives (IO) 1, 2 and 5 for the SIDA funded project and IOs 2, 3, 4 and 5 of the Finland project, thereby supporting the Overall Objective of both projects.

The main impact achieved by the projects is the following:

1. Tensions between Lebanese and Syrian displaced people were diffused and interactions between youth from both communities increased in three communities as a result of the work done by the YICs;
2. Capacities and skills of Syrian youth, including women, were strengthened thanks to the services provided in the YICs and the media training received;
3. Access of Syrian refugees to relevant information and to communication increased. The impact of the radio programme was amplified thanks to the partnership with UNHCR, which distributed 1000 radio units to 1000 Syrian families;
4. Capacities of Lebanese journalists in safety issues and electoral coverage were strengthened. It is likely that journalism students' knowledge on safety for journalists will increase as a result of the recent introduction of the module in the university curricula, but it is a bit early to assess this;
5. Awareness on the importance of freedom of expression and press freedom (including Internet freedom) was raised among the public in the country.

Most of this impact cannot be measured as it is qualitative. The identified changes are a direct result of the projects. There are no unintended or unexpected long term effects of the projects. There are no negative long term effects of the projects.

2.5. Sustainability–Management–Governance > MEDIUM-HIGH

Most of the benefits of the project can be maintained after the project's finalisation: i) the modules on safety for journalists can be used in other Lebanese or Arab universities; ii) the journalistic skills that the Syrian youth gained as a result of their participation in the radio programme can be built upon; iii) although the local municipalities are covering the running costs of the YICs, they are also supported by the international partners (World Vision, Caritas and UNHCR); iv) the online course for independent media can be re-used at no additional cost; v) NGOs within the area where the YIC are present are building on their existence and using it for their own activities, hence, sustaining the YICs use and mission.

Some benefits will not be maintained unless additional funding is obtained: i) Radio Voice of Lebanon would like to continue producing radio programmes for the Syrian population, but these programmes are not sufficiently profitable for this private radio so more support would be needed; ii) additional conferences, meetings, training and events on freedom of expression and press freedom would require additional external funds.

The project is supported by local institutions: i) the municipalities of Kfarzabad, Qobayat and Khiam are covering running costs of the YIC; ii) the safety module was developed for incorporation into university journalism curricula, in coordination with universities; iii) the Minister of Information, Deans of Universities Media faculties and speakers from the Lebanese Parliament participated in conferences organised by the project.

1. Context of Jordan

The Jordanian government began a national dialogue process in 2011 to discuss political reform in the country with all related stakeholders and decision makers which also covered the media sector. A National Media Strategy was approved by the Government in June 2011 with the aim of creating an independent and professional media but it ended in 2015 and was not replaced by a new strategy for the period 2016-2020. In August 2015, the government and the EU agreed on the Jordan Media Action Plan (MAP) 2015-2017, that includes further reforms; UNESCO played a key role in its elaboration.

Since 2012 and the revision of the law on press and publications, the authorities have strengthened their control of media, especially on the web. Hundreds of websites have been blocked since 2013, mostly for the reason that they did not have a license. The terrorist activities carried out by militant groups in the region have recently intensified difficult relations between the media and the security apparatus in the country. Using security arguments, journalists are often detained and face convictions based on a vague anti-terrorism law. The Jordanian press carefully observes the red lines set by the authorities. Journalists are subjected to close monitoring of the intelligence services and are required to join the Jordanian Press Association (JPA), controlled by the state.

After more than 6 years of progressive decline in the World Press Freedom Index (produced by Reporters without Borders), the country moderately improved its position in 2016 when it ranked 135, 8 positions above its 2015 ranking. There are around 1.2 million Syrian refugees in Jordan.

2. Findings

2.1. Relevance > HIGH

The main groups targeted by the projects in Jordan were the following: 1) journalists, photojournalists and media professionals; 2) judges, lawyers and law students; 3) Syrian refugee youth; 4) Jordanian population at large, particularly youth and women. UNESCO's flexibility to adapt the activities within the defined objectives allowed for a good targeting of the real needs of the target groups.

There is a big need in Jordan for increased legal support to media. To address this need, project activities aimed at developing the capacities of lawyers and judges to better represent and defend the media in court. The projects addressed the need to strengthen journalistic and technical capacities of journalists (SIDA ER1) as well as their need for enhanced safety (SIDA ER2). Activities in schools aimed to improve MIL of the students (SIDA ER4), another important requisite in the country.

Important needs of the Syrian refugee community were also addressed, in line with Finland ER13. The project aimed at increasing the general access of the Syrian refugee population to communication and to relevant information and tried to give a stronger voice to this community in the Jordanian media. By addressing these needs, the project intended to alleviate the distress of this community and to improve its social integration within the Jordanian society.

Project activities also aimed to strengthen freedom of expression and press freedom (SIDA ER1), an important need of the Jordanian population, given the significant deterioration that these freedoms suffered during the last years in the country. Several activities contributed to UNESCO's Priority Gender Equality, in line with SIDA ER5: gender balance was kept in the group of trainees on media law and the vast majority of students who benefited from the Youth Information Centres (YIC) were girls.

2.2. Efficiency > MEDIUM-HIGH

Funds from donors were available on time. UNESCO worked closely with its partners and applied regular internal procedures and guidelines during planning and implementation to ensure that resources were used efficiently. The decentralised management of the projects' budget by the Amman office and the fact that UNESCO project staff remuneration was not covered by this budget ensured a

good cost-efficiency of the resources.

The Jordanian organisation Tech Tribes was contracted by UNESCO to implement the activities related to the establishment of a YIC in Mafraq. UNESCO sees Tech Tribes as a partner, but had to sign a contract for services with the organisation because there was a time limitation to sign an Implementing Partnership Agreement (IPA). This contradiction between the contractual arrangements and the real requirements and expectations of UNESCO generated some misunderstandings between both organisations which to some extent impacted on the management and reporting of this component. Due to those misunderstandings, some payments were delayed and the organisation had to advance money to cover the cost of some activities.

Most of the expected outputs were delivered on time, but the launching of the YIC, which took place only upon successful completion of all activities needed more time than expected (1.5 years in total) since obtaining the necessary approvals in the Ministry of Education took several months. Coordination and communication between UNESCO Headquarters (HQ) and the Amman office was good. The managerial support provided by the Amman office was conducive to the production of the expected outputs and results.

2.3. Effectiveness > MEDIUM-HIGH

All planned activities were implemented. Main outputs of the two projects were:

1. A YIC was established in Mafraq, north of the country, where the highest number of Syrian refugees is located. The centre consists of two computer labs and a library and was created within a public school for girls;
2. A capacity-building workshop for legal experts working on freedom of expression in Jordan was organised; 15 judges, 15 law students and 15 lawyers were trained;
3. A website was created as a comprehensive source on media laws and regulations in Jordan. The site provides information needed for journalists, lawyers, and various media stakeholders to better understand the legal context related to media and freedom of expression;
4. Conferences, consultations and other events were conducted in Amman to raise awareness about the importance of press freedom (mainly the World Press Freedom Day);
5. UNESCO incorporated MIL into a number of Jordanian schools with the aim of introducing it into the national curriculum;
6. A regional training workshop on the UNESCO Media Development Indicators (MDI) methodology targeting senior media experts from the Arab region was organised by UNESCO HQ Paris. 11 media experts took part in it;
7. A 5-day regional workshop on Photojournalism and Conflict-Sensitive Reporting in the Age of New Media was organised in Jordan by UNESCO project officer at HQ/Paris with 17 young photo journalists;
8. A radio programme titled “Sa’a Suriya” targeting Syrian refugees was broadcast. Given the success, this activity was later replicated in Lebanon.

The establishment of the YIC encountered some technical difficulties. When Tech Tribes was contracted by UNESCO, the Internet access in the Mafraq school was not working and it took several months for the Ministry of Education to repair it. In the end, the internet service was too slow to effectively conduct Internet training sessions with teachers.

These outputs led to the achievement of ER 13 for the Finland project and ER 1, ER 2, ER 3 and ER 5 for the Sida project. Consulted beneficiaries of the workshops and training on media legal support for journalists were satisfied with the quality of the training and with the new knowledge and skills they gained. Syrian student girls from the Mafraq school who were consulted were satisfied with the new YIC, but admitted that they mostly use the library and the computer lab during class time and not during their free time.

The UNESCO office in Amman is in a strong position to facilitate multi-stakeholder debate and consultations with the government on an enabling framework for media freedom as it is perceived as a credible and neutral actor in the country has a good relationship with the Government and a strong

experience in the field of media. The use of SISTER, a set of IT-based management tools, which follows and supports the Results-Based Management (RBM) approach, ensured a good monitoring of the implemented activities. Project activities were followed by the media.

2.4. Impact > MEDIUM-HIGH

The project contributed to the Immediate Objectives (IO) 1, 2, 4 and 5 for the SIDA funded project and IOs 2, 3, 4 and 5 of the Finland project, thereby supporting the Overall Objective of both projects. The main long-term effects achieved by the projects are the following:

1. Access of Syrian refugees (mainly girls) to relevant information and to communication increased thanks to the “Sa’a Suriya” radio programme and the YIC, although part of the consulted Syrian students already have access to Internet either at home or through their smartphones;
2. The number of lawyers and judges with legal media knowledge to defend journalists has increased, but trained lawyers are not yet organised;
3. An online platform which exists as the sole comprehensive source for media laws and regulations in Jordan is now functional;
4. Awareness was raised in the country on the importance of freedom of expression and press freedom (including Internet freedom).

The identified changes are a direct result of the projects but most of this impact cannot be measured as it is qualitative. The projects did not create any unintended or negative long term effects.

2.5. Sustainability–Management–Governance > MEDIUM-HIGH

Sustainability of the benefits obtained from the YIC after the end of the project is appropriate. The new equipment of the YIC is likely to be used for several years and the Mafraq school could cover maintenance with its own resources, but it would be difficult for the school to fund an eventual renovation of the computer lab and library without further support from donors. The new capacities and skills gained by the trained teachers are likely to be sustained in the future and will benefit several cohorts of new students every academic year. The strong gender responsiveness of the project is likely to continue in the future as new female students will enrol every academic year and will benefit from the results of the project, such as trained teachers and available labs and equipment.

The YIC is fully integrated with local social and cultural conditions as it was installed within a public school for girls and is supported by the municipality. The Ministry of Education supports the YIC as all activities that were carried out in the school had to be approved by them. The Ministry of Planning and International Cooperation has put in place very restrictive criteria to allow for the implementation of any project/activity targeting Syrian refugees, especially youth, which is a negative factor for sustainability of the project benefits. After the London “Supporting Syria and the Region” Conference of February 2016, some of the restrictions – those related to Vocational education and employment for Syrian refugees - were lifted, as part of the “Jordan Compact” announced at the same Conference.

The benefits brought by the capacities and skills that lawyers and judges have gained are likely to be sustained, but they may lose value if they are not complemented with additional courses. Since the workshops and training were given, new media related laws have been approved and amendments made to audio visual laws. No network has been created yet by the trained lawyers, so the sustainability and updating of the website with legal media support is not guaranteed. To address this concern, the Amman Office has now formulated a new proposal for the new UNESCO-Swedish funding 2016-2017, which foresees the establishment of the network.

1. Context of Syria

Since the start of the Syrian uprising, the division within the country territories between regime and opposition has resulted in the emergence of new media outlets created by citizen-journalists and reduced censorship in some rebel-held territories. These new media outlets filled a void that existed and successfully compete with the mainstream media, but their journalistic standards are still low. Many times, the line between facts and propaganda in their reporting is blurred.

Article 38 of the Syrian constitution provides for freedoms of speech and of the press, while a 2011 media law prohibits a “monopoly on the media,” guarantees the “right to access information about public affairs” and bans “the arrest, questioning, or searching of journalists.” In practice, however, press freedom is constantly violated in government-held areas.

Syria has become the world’s deadliest country for journalists. More than 130 journalists have been killed since the beginning of the civil war in 2011 according to different sources. Some militant groups have brutally suppressed independent media and freedom of expression in the areas under their de facto rule. Professional and citizen-journalists are frequently caught between the various parties involved in the conflict and are exposed to intimidation, arrests, abductions and murders.

There are over 4.8 million Syrian refugees outside of Syria, 1.5 million of whom are in Lebanon, 1.2 million in Jordan and 2.7 million in Turkey. Many Syrian independent media are based in Gaziantep, close to the Syrian border in Turkey, but the Turkish authorities and their Syrian counterparts keep them under surveillance. Others have fled to Lebanon and Jordan where they are able to express themselves more freely. Syria ranked 177 in the 2016 World Press Freedom Index (produced by Reporters without Borders), the worst position among the 9 countries targeted by the projects being evaluated. Tunisia ranked first of the group in position 96.

2. Findings

2.1. Relevance > HIGH

The main groups targeted in Syria were the following: 1) journalists, media professionals, media managers; 2) CSOs specialising in press freedom, freedom of information and media development; 3) the Syrian population at large, particularly women and youth; and 4) Syrian refugees in Jordan and Lebanon. Important needs of these target groups were correctly addressed by the projects funded by Sida and Finland.

Project activities aimed to raise international awareness on the challenges, risks and dangers faced by Syrian journalists and offered them the possibility to strengthen their capacities on safety, multimedia and conflict-sensitive reporting among others. Capacities of the Ethical Charter for Syrian Media (ECSM) were strengthened with the aim of consolidating this ethical reference for independent media. The conduct of a Media Development Indicators (MDI) study was initially planned (Finland ER6), but it lost its relevance after the outbreak of war, as almost all aspects of media development and freedom of expression were absent. Instead, UNESCO conducted a research on Syrian media audiences, which was a more relevant activity in the context of a war torn country.

Capacity-building training on the use of innovative Information and Communication Technology (ICT) solutions to protect Human Rights defenders (HRD) and freedom of expression was offered to CSOs. Activities promoting the collaboration and exchange between CSOs and the media aimed to increase the quality and relevance of information that is offered to the population.

The projects also addressed important needs of the Syrian refugees in Jordan and Lebanon, in line with Finland ER13. The project aimed at increasing the general access of the refugees -particularly youth- to communication and to relevant information and tried to give a stronger voice to this community in the Lebanese and Jordanian media. By addressing these needs, the project intended to alleviate the distress of refugees and to improve their social integration within host communities.

The projects strengthened gender equality by increasing the presence of women in the media, strengthening the gender approach of Syrian independent media and by increasing the production of specific media content that is relevant for women.

2.2. Efficiency > HIGH

Funds from the donors were available on time and resources of the projects were used efficiently. UNESCO worked closely with its partners and applied regular internal procedures and guidelines during planning and implementation to ensure that resources were used efficiently. There were no significant delays in the delivery of the expected outputs.

Due to the current conflict situation in Syria, UNESCO Headquarters (HQ) in collaboration with Beirut and Amman offices managed and followed-up most of the activities targeting Syrian beneficiaries. A few activities (radio programmes and Youth Information Centres) were implemented in the field, namely Jordan and Lebanon, with the refugees as the main target.

The work carried out by the joint Syrian-international coordination committee, launched in 2015 and facilitated by the Global Forum for Media Development (GFMD), had a positive effect in terms of efficiency, as it allowed the involved media actors to coordinate actions and avoid duplication of activities. The coordination mechanisms and contractual arrangements between UNESCO and its partners (some of them based in Gaziantep, Turkey) were conducive to achieving the ERs.

2.3. Effectiveness > MEDIUM-HIGH

Most of the planned activities were implemented, with new ones emerging according to priorities and evolving possibilities of execution. The main outputs of the two projects were:

1. a year-long training, capacity building and networking programme was conducted that gathered together CSOs and technological start-ups on the use of innovative ICT solutions for a better protection of Human Rights activists and journalists;
2. 10 Syrian experts (media professionals, journalists, and photojournalists) took part in World Press Freedom Day (WPDF) 2016 in Helsinki as panellists and members in the youth newsroom, and photojournalists had their work displayed at the event;
3. 8 Syrian young citizen journalists participated with the Arabic-language online course and open curriculum for independent media covering freedom of expression, gender-sensitive mainstreaming, ethical standards of journalists, technical skills and investigative journalism;
4. a capacity-building for the ECSM in fund-raising and conflict management was organised;
5. a virtual reality film called "In Their Press Vests", was created as an advocacy tool on the safety of journalists and presented at international events held in 2016 such as the WPDF and the World Humanitarian Summit;
6. capacity-building training and workshops for Syrian journalists on video production, security and conflict-sensitive reporting were conducted;
7. in the framework of the project "My Story", 15 video reports on issues related to women were produced and published;
8. research on Syrian audiences was conducted which included data collection on media use, media literacy and perceived media/information needs of Syrian audiences in and outside the country across the geopolitical divides;
9. Several coordination meetings for Syrian and international media organisations, moderated by the GFMD, were organized in Europe;
10. 4 YIC benefiting young Syrian refugees and host communities were established (3 in Lebanon and one in Jordan), offering computer lab and library services as well as common space for awareness, integration and capacity building to its users;
11. 2 radio programmes targeting displaced Syrian youth were produced by Yarmouk FM in Jordan

and Radio Voice of Lebanon to empower youth, provide them with humanitarian information and give them a voice to express themselves.

These outputs led to the achievement of ER9 and ER13 for the Finland project. ER6 was not achieved because the MDI study could not be produced due to the conflict; at the time when the proposal was submitted to the donor, the situation in the country was tolerable, but this changed later with the outbreak of war and UNESCO decided to conduct instead an audience research. For Sida, ER1, ER2 and ER5 were achieved. The project did not create any unintended or negative long term effects.

UNESCO is seen as a neutral and credible actor by media stakeholders and the population. This perception is an important comparative advantage in implementing these projects, as other agencies are seen as taking sides in the Syrian conflict. Stakeholders consulted considered UNESCO a flexible partner, not prescriptive, and think that as a multi-lateral body it provides reassurance to the Syrian journalists. Local partners of UNESCO were in charge of the monitoring of implemented activities.

2.4. Impact > MEDIUM-HIGH

The project contributed to the Immediate Objectives (IO) 1, 2 and 5 for the SIDA funded project and IOs 2, 3, 4 and 5 of the Finland project, thereby supporting the Overall Objective of both projects. The main long-term effects achieved by the projects are the following:

1. The awareness about the challenges, risks and dangers faced by Syrian journalists was raised at the international level;
2. The capacities of Syrian journalists on video production, conflict sensitive reporting, security measures and safety risk management were significantly strengthened; the self-regulation capacities of the media professionals were also strengthened;
3. Collaboration, coordination and exchange between media and civil society actors, particularly on issues concerning women has increased;
4. The use of ICT solutions by CSOs to protect HRD and freedom of expression has increased;
5. Gender approach in the Syrian independent media has been strengthened and the coverage of issues related to women has increased;
6. Access of Syrian refugees to relevant information and to communication increased in Lebanon and Jordan. Capacities, knowledge and skills of Syrian youth, including women, were strengthened. Tensions between Syrian refugees and hosting communities were diffused.

The identified changes are a direct result of the projects. There are no unintended or negative long term effects of the projects.

2.5. Sustainability–Management–Governance > MEDIUM-HIGH

The new knowledge, capacities and skills that media experts acquired in the framework of the projects are likely to be maintained for a long period of time, but most of the training and workshops could not be sustained without additional funds as CSOs do not have the necessary financial capacity to implement them. However, CSOs are now in a better position to deal with external partners and more informed about raising funds for their projects. The ECSM is likely to be sustained in the long term as adopting an ethical, rigorous and professional approach is in the interest of a new independent media. The film “In Their Press Vests” can be used in the longer term as an advocacy tool on the safety of journalists, at no extra cost. The films that were produced on issues related to women can be used for a long time as an awareness raising tool, but it will be difficult for media and civil society actors to produce additional content without additional funds. The general sustainability of the benefits is closely linked to the resolution of the conflict in Syria.

1. Context of South Sudan

The already fragile situation of journalists in this young country, created in 2011, has only been worsened by a civil war that began in late 2013. Due to widespread intimidation, self-censorship on sensitive topics became common among all media houses, leaving the public with limited access to independent reporting and worrying deterioration of an enabling environment for the media to operate in. Some journalists fled the country as they felt they were in danger while others quit the profession.

In recent years, there has been evidence of the attacks against the physical safety of journalists (SoJ) and media workers as well as of incidents affecting their ability to work due to threats of prosecution, arrest, imprisonment, media houses closure, confiscation of newspapers and failures to investigate and prosecute crimes against them.

Statistics gathered by UNESCO and other organisations testify to the staggering number of journalists and media workers killed while performing their professional duties with the highest number witnessed in 2015 when 7 journalists were killed. According to the International Freedom of Expression Exchange (IFEX), in nine out of ten cases, the perpetrators of these crimes are never prosecuted, something that perpetuates the cycle of violence against journalists.

The country ranked 140th in the 2016 World Press Freedom Index (produced by Reporters without Borders), 15 positions lower than in 2015, when it ranked 125th. This reduction gives an idea of the further deterioration of the media environment in the country since 2013. Through the UN General Assembly Resolution A/RES/68/163, UNESCO was tasked as the overall coordinator of the UN Plan of Action on Safety of Journalists and the issue of Impunity and South Sudan accepted to be one of the 5 countries to pilot this UN Plan of Action.

2. Findings

2.1. Relevance > HIGH

The main groups targeted by the projects in South Sudan were the following: 1) journalists and media professionals, independent media outlets/associations, journalism/communication educational institutions, and media freedom defenders, working at the international, regional and national levels; 2) relevant government organs such as national police service; as well as 3) the population at large. Important needs of these target groups were correctly addressed by the project funded by Sida.

Project activities aimed to increase safety of journalists and an enabling environment for media fundamental freedoms, which are constantly threatened in the country. Many other needs of the media sector were addressed, such as increased coordination between media actors, the elaboration of a Media Support Strategy (MSS), capacity-building of media personnel and media associations on safety and security of journalists and human rights; improved data collection and reporting of violations committed against journalists; establishing a legal framework for media; advocating for end to impunity; improving the relation and cooperation with security forces; strengthening skills of journalism students, and safety and security of journalists.

The project aimed to increase access of the population to relevant information, emphasising media coverage of youth and women issues. Freedom of expression and press freedom, which are highly needed in the young country, were also addressed. Tensions between local communities are one of the factors behind the war that has ravaged the country since 2013. The project tried to diffuse these tensions through the establishment of community based media channels for dialogue. The projects contributed to gender equality mainly through the creation of four clubs for radio listeners: two clubs for women and two for youth (with a vast presence of girls).

2.2. Efficiency > HIGH

Funds from donors were available on time. UNESCO worked closely with its partners and applied regular internal procedures and guidelines during planning and implementation to ensure that resources were used efficiently. The cost-efficiency of the project is high, with a relatively reduced budget, UNESCO Juba office managed to implement a wide range of activities, involving many different partners and stakeholders. Most of the expected outputs were delivered on time. Only those produced outside Juba were slightly delayed due to security fears.

1. The establishment of the South Sudan Media Sector Working Group (SSMSWG) and the Media Donor Group (MDG) have significantly contributed to increasing the efficiency in the use of resources dedicated to the media sector, as they allowed for a better coordination of activities between different media organisations, avoiding possible duplication and facilitating the generation of synergies. No additional activities could have been implemented with the same resources without reducing their quality or quantity.
2. UNESCO signed a contract with 25 project partners for activities to be implemented. The coordination mechanisms and contractual arrangements between UNESCO and its partners were conducive for achieving the ERs.

2.3. Effectiveness > MEDIUM-HIGH

All planned activities were implemented. Main outputs of the project were:

- freedom of expression, press freedom and freedom of information were visibly discussed in the 3rd May World Press Freedom Day and 2nd November International Day to End Impunity on Crimes against journalists events that were organized in Juba between the media, government police and national security;
- 3 new media laws were adopted (Media Authority Act, Broadcasting Corporation Act and Right of Access to Information Act), and members of the 3 corresponding media bodies were appointed, but their independence is questioned because the national security exert an indirect control over them. The media law criminalises defamation accusations instead of dealing with them via the civil code;
- the SSMSWG, a MDG, a MSS and a country plan of action on SoJ were established;
- police were trained on the role of the media, freedom of expression, media laws, safety of journalists and fostering a working relationship between police and media;
- training modules on safety of journalists were established at the University of Juba and at AMDISS Media Development Institute; journalism student press clubs were established in 5 universities that have communication programmes;
- human and technical capacities of media personnel were built in various specialised areas such as in safety of journalists, conflict sensitive reporting, photojournalism, Human Rights reporting, and 4 media associations were strengthened;
- 10 media observatory committees (MOCs) were established in 10 states, although only 7 are functional and some of them are not trusted by the local journalists because they fear that the committees are infiltrated by the security services;
- 2 listeners clubs for women and 2 listeners clubs for youth were created in Wau and Rumbek.

These outputs led to the achievement of Sida's ER1, ER2, ER4 and ER5. UNESCO is seen as a neutral and credible actor by media stakeholders and the population. This perception is an important comparative advantage in implementing this project, since other donors/agencies are seen as taking sides in the South Sudanese conflict.

The use of SISTER, a set of IT-based management tools which follows and supports the Results-Based Management (RBM) approach, ensured a good monitoring of the implemented activities. All the partners of UNESCO submitted activity reports (both narrative and financial) to UNESCO Juba office.

2.4. Impact > HIGH

The project contributed to the Immediate Objectives (IO) 1, 2 and 5 for the SIDA funded project and IOs 1, 2, 3 and 4 of the Finland project, thereby supporting the Overall Objective of both projects. The main long-term effects achieved by the project are the following:

- Increased coordination of actions and information exchange between key media stakeholders, including donors;
- Increased safety of journalists working in the country;
- Improved relations between the media sector and the authorities, including security forces;
- Increased collection of data on violations committed against journalists;
- Improved enabling environment for the media, including first steps toward the establishment of the necessary legal framework, although there is still much room for improvement;
- Increased awareness on the importance of freedom of expression, press freedom and peace-building in the country;
- Increased technical and journalistic capacities of journalists, media CSOs and journalism students;
- Improved radio coverage of relevant community issues, including women and gender issues;

The identified changes are a direct result of the projects. There are no unintended or negative long term effects of the projects.

2.5. Sustainability–Management–Governance > MEDIUM-HIGH

Some benefits of the project are likely to be maintained after its finalisation:

- the SSMSWG, the Country Plan of Action on Safety of Journalists and the MSS are likely to be maintained as they are needed by the media stakeholders;
- all the knowledge gained in training, workshops and public events;
- the media observatory committees (MOCs), as it is in the interest of journalists to maintain them, though a serious issue is the lack of trust of some journalists towards the MOCs which puts at risk their sustainability;
- the 3 new media laws are likely to be maintained, although their degree of application is low; the criminalisation of defamation and the interference of the security services are negative factors for sustainability;
- the training modules on Safety of Journalists and in media at the University of Juba as they do not imply any extra cost and are requested by the students;
- inclusion of Media freedom and safety of Journalists as an agenda point in the South Sudan Police Accountability Mechanism, but will depend on the evolution of the political situation;
- establishment of the MDG, as it is in the interest of donors to improve coordination and to avoid eventual duplications.

Some other benefits are less likely to be sustained: i) training for journalists and the organisation of large public events, due to their cost; ii) radio listener clubs for women and youth, because most of their members ask for technical and material support (transportation, refreshment, training). If this is not provided by the community radios, the commitment of the members may be negatively affected and the sustainability of these clubs may be at risk. Minimal funds would be needed to sustain them.

The project is supported by local authorities, the police and media regulation bodies. Nevertheless, the overall level of governance in the host-country remains low as many of the institutions are young and provisional with public servants lacking training and relevant experience to further good practice.

Annex 2 – List of interviewees

Name	Location of the interview	Target country	Email	Position	Institution
Ma'aly Hazzaz	France/Skype call	global	m.hazzaz@unesco.org	Project officer	UNESCO Headquarters
Sylvie Coudray	France/Skype call	global	s.coudray@unesco.org	Head of Section	UNESCO Headquarters
Tarja Turtia	France/Skype call	global	t.turtia@unesco.org	Programme Specialist	UNESCO Headquarters
Rosario Soraide	France/call	global	r.soraide@unesco.org	Programme Specialist	UNESCO Headquarters
Frédérique Cifuentes	Helsinki	global	f.cifuentes@unesco.org	Consultant Curator	Independent
Caroline Giraud	Brussels	global	coordinator@gfmd.info	Programmes Manager	Global Forum for Media Development (GFMD)
Ilkka Nousiainen	Helsinki	Finland	Ilka.nousiainen@primainfo.fi	Coordinator - Finland	Reporters Without Borders
Marja-Liisa Kinturi	Helsinki	Finland	kinturi@dlc.fi	Journalist	Freelance
Kari Alanko	Helsinki	global	kari.alanko@formin.fi	Deputy Director General	Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland
Marie Ottosson	Helsinki	global		Assistant Director General	SIDA
Iyad Kallas	Helsinki	Syria	iyad@souriali.com	Programs Director	Radio Souriali
Yahya Fares	Skype call	Syria	fares@freepressunlimited.org	Manager	Mawared Centre
George Awad	Lebanon	Lebanon/Syria	g.awad@unesco.org	Communication & Information Programme Officer	UNESCO Office in Beirut
Bruno Attieh	Lebanon	Lebanon/Syria	batieh@eclmc.org	Director of the migrant centre	Caritas

Name	Location of the interview	Target country	Email	Position	Institution
Matti Lassila	Lebanon	Lebanon/Jordan	khaledoun@vdl.com.lb	Ambassador	Embassy of Finland
Maya Lteif	Lebanon	Lebanon/Syria	maya_lteif@wvi.org	Education officer	World Vision
Ali Shahla	Lebanon	Lebanon/Syria		Coordinator	Youth Information Centre in Kfarzabad
Chadi Maalouf	Lebanon	Lebanon/Syria	chadym@vdl.com.lb	Programs Manager	Radio Voice of Lebanon
Khaled Hijab	Jordan	Jordan/Syria	khaled@techtribes.org	Executive Director	Tech Tribes
Samiha Abu Hiljeh	Jordan	Jordan/Syria		School principle	Al Rubaie' Bint Al Mouawath School
8 women	Jordan	Jordan/Syria		Teachers and staff	Al Rubaie' Bint Al Mouawath School
5 Syrian girls	Jordan	Jordan/Syria		Students	Al Rubaie' Bint Al Mouawath School
Constanza Farina	Jordan	Jordan/Syria	c.farina@unesco.org	Head of Office and country Representative	UNESCO Office in Amman
Ikhlas Aal Khawaldh	Jordan	Jordan/Syria	i.aal-khawaldh@unesco.org	Communication and Information Programme Officer	UNESCO Office in Amman
Mohammed Qutaishat	Jordan	Jordan	mohammad@ifclaw.com	Trainer, media lawyer	
Anas Joher	Jordan	Jordan	anas.aljoher@yahoo.com	Lawyer, trainee	Petra University
Tareq Abu-Khader	Jordan	Jordan	tarekabukhader@yahoo.com	Lawyer, trainee	
I'tidal Al Wazani	Jordan	Jordan	etidal.alwazani@hotmail.com	Lawyer, trainee	
Noor Sultan	Jordan	Jordan	nsultan@clejordan.com	Lawyer, trainee	Adel Law Firm
Andrea Cairola	Morocco	Morocco	a.cairola@unesco.org	Councillor Communication and Information (CI)	UNESCO Office in Rabat

Name	Location of the interview	Target country	Email	Position	Institution
Khalid Aoutail	Morocco	Morocco	k.aoutail@unesco.org	Associated Expert CI Section	UNESCO Office in Rabat
Rim Baji	Morocco	Morocco	r.baji@unesco.org	Consultant CI Section	UNESCO Office in Rabat
Maryem Chlal	Morocco	Morocco	m.chlal@unesco.org	Intern CI Section	UNESCO Office in Rabat
Jamal Eddine Naji	Morocco	Morocco	jamaledidine.naji@gmail.com	Director General	Higher Authority for Audiovisual Communication (HACA)
Mohamed Leghtas	Morocco	Morocco	lmohaster@gmail.com	Coordinator	Forum des Alternatives Maroc (FMAS)
Imane Bounjara	Morocco	Morocco	b.imane@forumalternatives.org	Project Manager	Forum des Alternatives Maroc (FMAS) and e-Joussour community radio
Abderrahim Foukahi	Morocco	Morocco	abderrahimfoukahi@hotmail.fr	President	Centre marocain pour le Droit d'accès à l'information (CEMDI)
Vittoria Rinaldi	Morocco	Morocco	vittoria.rinaldi@soleterre.org	Project Manager	Soleterre
Marius Lukosiunas	Skype call	Egypt	m.lukosiunas@unesco.org	Programme Specialist CI Section	UNESCO Headquarters
Hara Padhy	Skype call	Egypt	h.Padhy@unesco.org	Councillor CI Section	UNESCO Office in Cairo
Tarek Atia	Helsinki	Egypt	tarek@emdponline.com	Director	Egypt Media Development Program
Mohamed Adel	Helsinki	Egypt		Photo journalist, exhibitor at WPF 2016	Freelance
Salah Khaled	South Sudan	South Sudan	s.khaled@unesco.org	Head of Office and country Representative	UNESCO Office in Juba
Lydia Gachungi	South Sudan	South Sudan	l.gachungi@unesco.org	Communication and information specialist	UNESCO Office in Juba
Irene Ayaa	South Sudan	South Sudan	ayaa.irene@amdiss.org	Media Development Officer	Association for Media Development in South Sudan (AMDISS)

Name	Location of the interview	Target country	Email	Position	Institution
Edmund Yakani	South Sudan	South Sudan	ed@cepo-southsudan.org	Executive Director	Community Empowerment for Progress Organization (CEPO)
Norbert Otieno	South Sudan	South Sudan	norbertotieno@yahoo.com	Director/Station Manager	Good News radio station
Edward Terso	South Sudan	South Sudan	etx1962peace@gmail.com	Secretary General	Union of Journalists of South Sudan (UJOSS)
Flora Jembi Ali	Helsinki	South Sudan	florahenry@yahoo.com	Photo journalist, exhibitor at WPF 2016	Freelance
Ikilass Henry	Helsinki	South Sudan	ikilasshenry@gamil.com	Photo journalist, exhibitor at WPF 2016	Freelance
Alfred Taban	South Sudan	South Sudan	sharealfred33@gmail.com	Press Freedom Monitor	Union of Journalists of South Sudan (UJOSS)
Nouri Lajmi	Tunisia	Tunisia	nouri_lajmi@haica.tn	President	Independent High Authority for Audiovisual Communication (HAICA)
Neji Bghouri	Tunisia	Tunisia	nejibghouri@gmail.com	President	National Union of Tunisian Journalists (SNJT)
Fahem Boukkaddus	Tunisia	Tunisia	fahem.snjt@gmail.com	Executive Director	National Union of Tunisian Journalists (SNJT)
Dawadim Mahmoud	Tunisia	Tunisia	dawadim@gmail.com	President	Tunis Center for Presse Freedom
Yasmine Kacha	Tunisia	Tunisia	ykacha@rsf.org	Representative	Reporters without borders
Nejib Mokni	Tunisia	Tunisia	nejib@article19.org	Project Coordinator	Article 19
Issaaf Ben Khalifa	Tunisia	Tunisia	ibenkhalifa@ohchr.org	Human Rights Officer	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)
Héla Skhiri	Tunisia	Tunisia	hela.skhiri@unwomen.org	National Program Officer	UN Women
Nozha ben Mohamed	Tunisia	Tunisia	nozhabmohamed@gmail.com	Director	Radio 6
Chwatt Chokri	call	Tunisia	Info.ulysefm@gmail.com	Director	Radio Ulysse Fm
Cedric Neri	Tunisia	Tunisia	c.neri@unesco.org	Project Assistant (CI)	UNESCO Office in Tunis
Mehdi Benchelah	Skype call	Tunisia	m.benchelah@unesco.org	Senior Project Officer	UNESCO Headquarters

Name	Location of the interview	Target country	Email	Position	Institution
Mariana Figueroa-Sánchez	Tunisia	Libya	mariana.figueroa@maec.es	Deputy Head of Mission	Embassy of Spain in Tripoli
Stephen Ibelli	Tunisia	Libya	lbelliSF@state.gov	Head, Public diplomacy unit	US Embassy in Tripoli
Ronald Sturm	Tunisia	Libya	ronald.sturm@bmeia.gv.at	Ambassador	Austrian Embassy in Tripoli
Najla Wassar	Tunisia	Libya	najlawassar@bmeia.gv.at	Assistant to the Ambassador	Austrian Embassy in Tripoli
Salma Al shaab	Tunisia	Libya	salmasb48@gmail.com	Journalist	Independent Journalist
Sumaia Salem	Tunisia	Libya	moon4rise@yahoo.com	Journalist	Independent Journalist
Neven Al Houni	Tunisia	Libya	neven92014@yahoo.com	Journalist	Independent Journalist
Fathi ben Isa	call	Libya	fathbenessa@hotmail.com	Media Consultant	Independent Media Consultant
Khalid Bahloul	call	Libya	kmbgroup.co@gmail.com	Owner of Tobaktus Network	Tobaktus Network
Mustafa Barouni	call	Libya	mustfa172@yahoo.com	Mayor of Zintan	Mayor of Zintan
Raja'a El Abasi	Tunis	Tunis	r.el-abasi@unesco.org	CI focal point	UNESCO Office in Tunis
Jacqueline Dalton	Skype call	Yemen	jacqueline.dalton@bbc.co.uk	Senior Producer / Trainer – Humanitarian Programming	BBC Media Action
Mustafa Nasr	call	Yemen	economicmedia@gmail.com	Chairman	Studies and Economic Media Center
Shadha Hottam	call	Yemen	shada91hottam@yahoo.com	Freelance	Journalist
Marion Desmurger	Skype call	Yemen	m.desmurger@unesco.org	Senior Programme Assistant Communication Information	Office in UNESCO Doha